

Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	International Journal of Environment and Climate Change
Manuscript Number:	Ms_IJECC_81439
Title of the Manuscript:	A District Level Assessment of Instability in Crop Productivity in Karnataka State
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<https://www.journalijecc.com/index.php/IJECC/editorial-policy>)

Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)												
Compulsory REVISION comments	<p>Abstract</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Add line numbers to the text, only several examples 2. The text is bad worded: "The study has examined the instability of crop Productivity of principal crops for 20 years..." the word is twice and 'crop' is twice. Also check the text with Grammarly (it is free). 3. You indicate: "Five instability categories were used", How you define the: "Instability"? Describe the index first and then the levels! 4. Why to spend unnecessary words, use" Two periods were defined for the study from 1998 until 2009 and from 2009 until 2019" 5. Explain the: "Cudde Della Valle index". 6. Are these regions in India: Arhar, Gram, Groundnut, Jowar. 7. How you jump to. Instability in Pulses. <p>Introduction</p> <p>Again wording and lack of important data to the reader, several examples</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Add map, best is topographic or orthophoto, of Karnataka and the analyzed regions. 2. Give the scientific names of the crops. 3. Does 4. Use hectares not lakhs 5. Again as the abstract don't use the same word twice: "The variation in cultivation leads to variations". 6. Does it another region in India Tamil Nadu and Kerala? Where does it? 7. Production or Productivity???Why in capital letters. <p>Materials and Methods</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Explain the Cuddy- Della Valle index. 2. Each equation you must number and its' parameters in brackets. This is a worse presentation. 3. Again wording and punctuation 4. Use: "The instability values grouped as follows:....., Instead of: The range of Instability are as follows: <p>Results and Methods</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Why do you not separate these sections?! 2. For clarification of Table 1 You can use the following type: 													
Minor REVISION comments	<table border="0" style="width: 100%; text-align: center;"> <tr> <td colspan="2">Rice</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="background-color: #cccccc;">Very low</td> <td>Tumkur (5.87), Mysore (6.38)....</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="background-color: #cccccc;">Average</td> <td>.....</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2">Maize</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="background-color: #cccccc;">Very low</td> <td>.....</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="background-color: #cccccc;">Average</td> <td>.....</td> </tr> </table>	Rice		Very low	Tumkur (5.87), Mysore (6.38)....	Average	Maize		Very low	Average	
Rice														
Very low	Tumkur (5.87), Mysore (6.38)....													
Average													
Maize														
Very low													
Average													
Optional/General comments	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 3. Use 'similar trend' not constant 4. Table 2.Per each crop this table? Again think to arrange it the type I demonstrated previously. Think on locating this Table in supplementary. Too many tables 5. What do you mean: "There is a need of intervention of improved cultural practices, varietal improvement, irrigation methods to stabilise the crop. " 6. Table 3. In the table title explain the meaning of: 'Pulses', arrange it! 7. Table 4. The same notes as Table 1. 8. I do not understand the Figs. They give mistaken trends of change but the X-axis is regions on 													

Review Form 1.6

	Karnataka? 9. Also, Why you add the gridlines of the X and Y axes, it is confusing! Also, try to reduce the number of graphs! In the discussion Possibly part of the results should be described here Give the suitability of the used index for other regions worldwide!	
--	---	--

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Amir Mussery
Department, University & Country	Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel