

Review Form 3

Journal Name:	European Journal of Nutrition & Food Safety
Manuscript Number:	Ms_EJNFS_128959
Title of the Manuscript:	Estimation of some heavy metals in different types of canned tuna in the Egyptian market
Type of the Article	

General guidelines for the Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guidelines for the Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

<https://r1.reviewerhub.org/general-editorial-policy/>

Important Policies Regarding Peer Review

Peer review Comments Approval Policy: <https://r1.reviewerhub.org/peer-review-comments-approval-policy/>

Benefits for Reviewers: <https://r1.reviewerhub.org/benefits-for-reviewers>

PART 1: Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.		
Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)		
Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.		
Is the manuscript scientifically, correct? Please write here.		
Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.		
Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?		
Optional/General comments	<p>Bismillah, Assalamualaikum Wrh. Wbr. Journal Review with the title : Estimation of some heavy metals in different types of canned tuna in the Egyptian market</p> <p>1. Title :</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The title is quite clear and describes the main topic of the research. - However, using the word "some" in the title could be considered insufficiently specific or too general. It is recommended to replace "some" with "Selected" or directly mention the type of heavy metal being studied, for example: "Estimation of Heavy Metals (Lead, Cadmium, Nickel, and Others) in Different Types of Canned Tuna in the Egyptian Market". This will give the reader a more specific idea of the scope in the research. <p>2. Abstrac :</p> <p>The abstract includes all important elements, namely background, objectives, methods, results and conclusions. Points Needing Improvement :</p> <p>a. Clarity of Structure: The structure of the abstract can be further optimized with greater clarity between the background, method, results, and conclusion sections. For example:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Background : It is important to understand the heavy metal content in canned tuna and its impact on health. - Research Objective: To measure and compare the heavy metal content in five brands of canned tuna on the Egyptian 	

Review Form 3

	<p>market.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">- Results and Discussion: Heavy metal concentrations were generally below safe limits except for nickel in one of the samples, but HQ and HI still showed no significant health risk.- Conclusion: No major health risks were identified for consumption of canned tuna from these five brands. <p>b. Abstract Editing Suggestions: Statements regarding nickel concentrations exceeding the limit in one sample can be further suppressed because this is an important finding that needs to be highlighted.</p> <p>c. Keywords can be more specific and relevant, for example: <i>Canned tuna, heavy metals, lead, cadmium, nickel, dietary risk, Egyptian market</i></p> <p>3. Material and Methods</p> <p>a. Clarity and Structure :</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">- This section is self-explanatory and detailed, covering information on chemicals, sample collection, preparation methods, heavy metal analysis, and health risk assessment.- The steps in sample preparation and heavy metal analysis are arranged systematically, so they are easy to follow.- Suitable Method Description: The use of modern devices and techniques such as microwave digestion and SSA is sufficient for heavy metal analysis. Parameters such as temperature, time, and chemicals for sample digestion are well explained.- Health Risk Assessment: This approach to calculating EDI, HQ, and HI shows attention to public health impacts, giving greater relevance to research results. <p>b. Areas for Improvement</p> <p>1. Language Consistency :</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">- Some sentences feel less polished and could be refined to improve readability. For example: "The vessel was totally and excellently closed before being placed to the microwave till digestion was complete" can be simplified to: "The vessel was securely sealed and placed in the microwave until digestion was complete."- Phrases like "totally and excellently closed" sound redundant and informal <p>2. Details on Heavy Metal Analysis:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">- It is not explained what heavy metals are measured with the Atomic Absorption Spectrophotometer. This information is important to confirm the scope of the research.- Please state whether the device was previously calibrated, and if so, what calibration method was used. <p>3. Explanation of Sampling Locations : the reasons for choosing the location were not explained. For example, due to the high consumption of canned tuna in the area.</p> <p>4. Referenc : References ([19], [20], [21], and [22]) are not stated in full, so readers cannot directly verify the sources used. Make sure complete references are included in the bibliography section.</p> <p>5. Specificity in Health Risk Calculations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">- The formula for HQ: $HQ = (EDI/RFD)10^{-3}$ is not explained in sufficient detail. What is meant by "RFD" ? It is best described as a "reference dose" or other relevant term.- BW (body weight) is set as 70 kg for the Egyptian adult population, but there is no explanation whether this is based on survey data or assumptions. The research would be stronger if the sources of this data were explained.- FIR (Fish Intake Rate) of 48.57 g/day was stated without justification. Are these figures based on local dietary surveys, national averages, or international references? A brief explanation is required. <p>3. Results and discussion Strengths:</p> <p>Comprehensive data presentation, namely statistical significance in tables., In-depth analysis, namely discussion connecting research findings, Health Risk Assessment, Comparative Insights add depth and relevance to the analysis.</p> <p>Points Needing Improvement :</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">- The discussion section is too long and there is repetition, especially in the explanation of heavy metals such as lead and cadmium. For example, the health risks of lead and cadmium are discussed repeatedly.- Images (such as Figure 1) are not well integrated into the text. An explicit explanation of the image and its interpretation would strengthen this section.- Some explanations, such as the digestion process of heavy metals or the significance of HQ and HI, can be simplified to improve understanding for a wider audience.- The nickel concentration in brand 4 shredded tuna exceeded the permitted limit, but the discussion focused less on this finding. This anomaly requires more attention and recommendations for regulatory action.- The discussion focuses too much on the safety of tuna brands, but not enough to explore the long-term implications of consuming low doses of heavy metals. For example, highlighting the cumulative effects of chronic exposure can add depth to the discussion. <p>4. Conclusion : The conclusion should be more focused and brief. Currently, there are several sentences that are long-winded and can come out without reducing the meaning, such as: "Therefore, the target consumers do not face significant potential health risks from consuming canned tuna from the five brands available on the Egyptian market" can interfere with: "Consumers of all five canned tuna brands in Egypt did not face significant health risks."</p>	
--	------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--

Review Form 3

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	De.Wiwin Rewini Kunusa
Department, University & Country	Universitas Negeri Gorontalo, Indonesia