ReviewForm3

JournalName:	InternationalJournalofEnvironmentandClimateChange
ManuscriptNumber:	**Ms_IJECC_129056**
TitleoftheManuscript:	**FloristicdiversityandseasonalvariationofherbaceousspeciesinTaxuscontortabearingstandsofKashmirHimalayas**
TypeoftheArticle	

PART1:Comments

	Reviewer'scomment	**Author'sFeedback***(Pleasecorrectthemanuscriptandhighlightthatpart inthemanuscript.Itismandatorythatauthorsshouldwritehis/herfeedback here)*
Pleasewriteafewsentencesregardingtheimportance of this manuscript for the scientific community. A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	**The topic is interesting and these kinds of studies are needed for places like Indian Himalayan Region whichisabiodiversityhotspot.Thepaperhashighlightedthe howspeciescompositionvariesandchanges during different seasons. Also points out what can be thereason behind such composition. Statistical data has been provided in the form of IVI values for further support**	
Isthetitleofthearticlesuitable? (Ifnotpleasesuggestanalternativetitle)	**Yes**	
Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggesttheaddition(ordeletion)ofsomepointsinth is section? Please write your suggestions here.	**Yesabstractneedstobeedited.**	
Isthemanuscriptscientifically,correct?Pleasewrite here.	Needssomedatatobereanalyzed	
Arethereferencessufficientandrecent?Ifyouhave suggestionsofadditionalreferences,pleasementio n them in the review form.	Additionofsomereferenceshasbeensuggestedinthecomments	
Isthelanguage/Englishqualityofthearticlesuitable for scholarly communications?	yes	
Optional/Generalcomments	**Author(s)needstorevisethemanuscript again.** **Followingarethecorrectionsandcommentsfortheabove-mentionedmanuscript**: 1. There are many endangered species growing in wild in Kashmir Himalaya. So, whyauthor has considered only *Taxus contorta* growing localities in the study. 2. **Reanalyzetheresults.** S.No. | Heading | Corrections/suggestions 1. | Abstract | Itshould beviz.,S1-Pahalgam | | Valueiswrong(71000N/ha) | | Intextits22.14insteadof22.13	

		IVIvalueof*Plantagolanceolata*is20.63atS3duringsummer season. Why it is skipped.
		'The lowest values were observed for *Thymus linearis* (3.57) at S9 and *Myosotis arvensis* (3.20) at S2.' In which season
		……*Plantagolanceolata*(23.44)atS3and*Oxaliscorniculata* (21.56)atS2……
		ThelowestIVIvaluesincluded*Daucuscarota*(2.21)atS2and *Festucarubra*(2.94)atS6.Thereareotherspecieswhichhaslower value than *Festuca rubra*
		The IVI of herb species depends upon the density, basal area and frequency at the site. IVI depends on the relative frequency, relative density and relative basal area. In methodology also author has given formula only for frequency,densityandbasalarea.Ifauthorhascalculated IVIonthe basisoffrequency,densityandbasalareathantheresultsarenot correct
		RESULTSMENTIONEDINTHEABSTRACTCONTRADICTSWITH THE RESULTS IN THE MAIN TEXT. PLEASE CHECK
2.	Introduction	Its0.48%givenintherefernecitedby author,not0.4%
		Itshouldbenearlyorabout12%becausethereisnofixedvalue
		ItsWestHimalayanYewnotWesternHimalayanYew
		Previouslyidentifiedas*Taxusbaccata*andlater……..
		Dogriislanguageorplace
		'It grows naturally in shady, sheltered locations at altitudes ranging from 1,700 to 3,300 masl, the associated species are *Quercus semecarpifolia*(Kharshu) and *Abies pindrow*(Silver Fir), *Picea smithiana*(Spruce),*Cedrusdeodara*(Deodar),and*Quercusdilatata*(Mo ruOak).'ItisawesternHimalayanregiondistributionoritisonly for Kashmir. Is it an original observation or cited from some reference. Write reference if it is not the author's observation
		'In the eastern Himalayas, it often grows alongside *Abies pindrow*and *Rhododendron species*.'*Taxus contorta* is naturally distributed onlyinthewesternIndianHimalayanregion.ItisnotfoundinEastern IndianHimalayanregion.
		Donotwritetheword'species'initalics
		'The Kashmir Valley's geography is further enriched by the Jhelum River,which,alongwithitstributaries,isamajorsourceofirrigation. TheValley'sdiversehabitatsincluderivers,lakes,springs,marshes, cultivatedfields,orchards,graveyards,forests,alpinemeadowsand glaciers. Its temperate climate is characterized by four distinct seasons: wet, cold winters (December-February), mild springs (March-May), warm summers (June-August) and cool autumns (September-November).' Shift the paragraph where author is explaining about Kashmir
		Toaddressgapsinunderstanding…. What kind of gaps. Please explain

	3.	Material and methods	‘Kashmirvalleyislocatedin thenorth-westernextremityof India, between33°Northlatitudeand75°Eastlongitude.Thevalley is locatedinthenorthernmostlatitudeofthecountryholds almost central position in the continent of Asia.Average altitude of Kashmir valley (valley zone) ranges between 1, 500 to 2, 300 m above sea level. The geographical expanse of Kashmir is 15, 948.00 sq km.’ Provide references for these. Writeaboutsoil, humidity andothernecessaryenvironmental factors also.		
			Itwillbebetterifauthorcanprovidethemapofstudylocations		
			‘The3siteswereselectedforstudyfromeach3regions.’ For each region three sites were selected for study.		
			Thenumberofindividualsofeachspecies……		
			Author(s)hastaken3quadratespersitewhichmeanshehas studied only 3x3m area per site which is not the satisfactory area considered for the study.		
			‘following(Phillips,1959**).’** ItshouldbefollowingPhillips,1959**.**		
			Whatisthedefinitionofdensity,frequencyandbasalarea. What is relative frequency, relative density and relative basal area and write their formula.		
			‘basalareawascalculatedfollowing(Phillips,1959**).’** ‘Basalarea(Misra,1968)’ Whichreferenceauthorhasfollowedoutofthese		
			Providedataonbasalarea,frequency,density,relative density,relativefrequencyandrelativebasalareaas supplementaryfiles.		
	4.	Results and Discussion	Duringthestudytotalof57herbspecieswererereported(inallthree seasons) among them the maximum herb species….		
			‘followedbySoutheastaspectsofVastoorwanandLolab,then northwest of Pahalgam, Tangmarg and Gumarg.’ ItsLolabthenVastoorwanfollowedbyTangmarg,GulmargandGund according to graph		
			Infig.1Density(No./ha.)		
			‘Thestudyreportedthatthe*Phytolaccaacinosa*showedthehighest IVI(28.34)atS3(remove‘atS3’.Itsrepeated)inautumnseason followed by summer season…’		
			‘*Thymus linearis*recorded the lowest IVI (2.80) at S5 and (2.72) at S9*.’* At S2 *Viola odorata* (2.65) in spring and *Daucus carota* (2.21) in autumn has lower values than *Thymus linearis*		
			Its22.14not 22.13.		
			Writefullnamesofsitesalso		
			‘*Thymuslinearis*showedthelowestIVIatS4(2.90),suggesting limited ecological….’ Checkitagain		
			Intableswriteacceptednamesofspeciesinsteadof synonyms.		

ReviewForm3

		Theword‘species’shouldnotbeinitalics. Check the spelling of scientific names Either write names of authors with species or remove it from all. In legend + sign is mentioned but it is not used anywhere in the table. Iwouldsuggestmerge allthree tablesin toonetoremove confusion
		‘The distribution of plant populations (instead of populations write species) in a given area is shaped’
5.	Conclusion	What is the overall conclusion. Author has mentioned about results only
		‘*Thymuslinearis*lowestIVI(2.90)atS4.’ *Festuca* has 2.82 at S2
		‘the lowest was reported for *Daucus carota, Festuca arundinacea*and *Poa annua* at S2 with respective IVI values (2.21, 3.14 and 3.20).’ *Verbasicumthapus*has lower values than *Festuca arundinacea*and*Poaannua*atS2(2.55),*Viola*has2.65atS7, *Myosotis*has2.72atS9
6.	References	Somereferencesaremissinginthetext butcitedinreference list.

PART 2:

	Reviewer’s comment	**Author’s comment***(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)*
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	*(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)*	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	**Sunita Bisht**
Department, University & Country	**Patanjali Research Foundation, India**