

Review Form 3

| | |
|--------------------------|--|
| Journal Name: | Journal of Experimental Agriculture International |
| Manuscript Number: | Ms_JEAI_129699 |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Exploring the Potential of Soil-less Farming through Hydroponics: A Review |
| Type of the Article | Review Article |

General guidelines for the Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guidelines for the Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

<https://r1.reviewerhub.org/general-editorial-policy/>

Important Policies Regarding Peer Review

Peer review Comments Approval Policy: <https://r1.reviewerhub.org/peer-review-comments-approval-policy/>

Benefits for Reviewers: <https://r1.reviewerhub.org/benefits-for-reviewers>

PART 1: Comments

| | Reviewer's comment | Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i> |
|--|--|---|
| Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part. | <p>In this study titled "Exploring the Potential of Soil-less Farming through Hydroponics: A Review"; the introduction of the system for the popularization of hydroponic farming in India, its operation and technique as well as its advantages and disadvantages are examined. It could be a good compilation study. However, it is seen that the publications of Numan Bildirici's, who has 4-5 books and many articles on the establishment of systems that provide entrepreneurial training and conducts joint projects with many European countries such as the Netherlands on the establishment of Hydroponics Farming Systems, which is one of the current agricultural topics today, and Aquaponics Systems, which is a more advanced technique, have not been reviewed at all. I have not come across any reference information. For this reason, the literature section should be revised by following the studies carried out on this subject, which will make significant contributions to plant nutrition studies in degraded and unproductive soils or in Urban Agriculture. Because this study is a current issue in our world, the majority of the references used belong to the years 2000 and before. There are only 3 references from the last five years in the study. In other words, it is not up to date.</p> <p>I recommend that you examine my Books, EU Project, Article and Publication studies on Hydroponics agriculture and its more advanced technique, Aquaponics Systems, in the links given below, and look at similar studies conducted on this subject in the world in recent years.</p> | |
| Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title) | <p>It is suitable. However; I think it would be better if the research location is specified as follows in the article title.</p> <p>"Exploring the Potential of Soil-less Farming through Hydroponics: A Review in India"</p> | |
| Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here. | <p>The summary of the article is sufficient. However, the purpose of Hydroponic Agriculture, its benefits, the potential of the method and its effect on yield components are not understood. It should be better specified.</p> | |
| Is the manuscript scientifically, correct? Please write here. | <p>If the deficiencies are corrected, it can be a compilation study that will contribute to science.</p> | |
| Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form. | <p>References are not up to date. This study is a current issue in our world. However, the majority of the references used are from the year 2000 and before. In last five years There is only tri (3) references after 2020. I think it would be useful to compare the results with the following publication studies.</p> | |

Review Form 3

| | | |
|---|---|--|
| | <p>1-) BİLDİRİCİ NUMAN, 2024. "THE DESIGN OF AN INNOVATIVE AQUAPONIC SYSTEM FOR THE CLIMATE CONDITIONS OF VAN CITY", UBAK Publishing–2021©, Editör: Assoc. Prof. Dr. Numan BİLDİRİCİ, Carlos Alberto Espinal, Basım sayısı:1, Sayfa Sayısı 88, Türkçe(Kitap). ISBN: 978-625-8151-23-7, August / 2024, Ankara / Turkey. https://www.ubakyayinevi.org/_files/ugd/614b1f_750d150f905a4d1996378dbd77c6d4f6.pdf</p> <p>2-) BİLDİRİCİ NUMAN, BİLDİRİCİ DİLARA ELİF, (2021). "SAĞLIKLI BİR GELECEK İÇİN AQUAPONİK SİSTEMLER" İksad Publications – 2021©, Editör: Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Numan BİLDİRİCİ, Basım sayısı:1, Sayfa Sayısı 84, ISBN:978-605-74646-9-9, Türkçe(Bilimsel Kitap).</p> <p>3-) BİLDİRİCİ N., 2020. THE EFFECTS OF COPPER-ZINC INTERACTIONS ON YIELD AND YIELD COMPONENTS IN SOILLESS GROWN BEANS (PHASEOLUS VULGARIS L.) APPLIED ECOLOGY AND ENVIRONMENTAL RESEARCH, cilt.18, sa.2, ss.2581-2598, 2020 (SCI-Expanded).</p> <p>4-) Bildirici, N., Bildirici, E.Ç., (2021). Aquaponik Sistemlerde Tarımsal Girişimcilik. <i>ISPEC 7th International Conference on Agriculture, Animal Sciences and Rural Development</i>, September 18-19, 2021 / Sayfa:880-889, Mus Alparslan University, Turkey.</p> | |
| Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications? | It is suitable. However, minor corrections are needed. | |
| Optional/General comments | | |

PART 2:

| | Reviewer's comment | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|--|---|---|
| Are there ethical issues in this manuscript? | (If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details) | |

Reviewer Details:

| | |
|----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Name: | Numan Bildirici |
| Department, University & Country | Van Yuzuncu Yil University, Turkiye |