

Review Form 3

Journal Name:	International Journal of Plant & Soil Science
Manuscript Number:	Ms_IJPSS_129691
Title of the Manuscript:	Original Research Article Assessment of Erosion Index through Rainfall Data for Hisar Region, Haryana
Type of the Article	

PART 1: Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	This manuscript is valuable for the scientific community as it contributes to understanding rainfall-induced soil erosion through the development of relationships between erosion indices and precipitation indices. It provides a streamlined method for estimating erosion indices using precipitation indices, which is particularly useful in regions like Hisar where long-term kinetic energy data may not be available. The study's focus on simplifying complex computations without compromising accuracy makes it applicable for soil and water conservation planning. Furthermore, the manuscript's emphasis on rainfall erosivity estimation is relevant to mitigating soil erosion in agriculture-intensive areas, aligning with global efforts in sustainable land management.	
Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)	The current title could be more descriptive to reflect the focus and findings of the study. A suggested alternative title is: "Development of Simplified Relationships Between Rainfall Erosion Indices and Precipitation Indices for Soil Conservation in Hisar, Haryana"	
Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.	The abstract of the article is comprehensive but could benefit from a clearer emphasis on the key findings and implications of the study. Suggestions for improvement: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Explicitly state the main objective of the study at the beginning. • Highlight the significance of the correlations developed between erosion and precipitation indices. • Conclude with a brief mention of the practical applications of the study in soil and water conservation. 	
Is the manuscript scientifically, correct? Please write here.	The manuscript is scientifically accurate. It employs established methodologies, such as the Universal Soil Loss Equation (USLE) and kinetic energy computations, to assess rainfall erosivity. The statistical relationships presented are supported by robust correlation coefficients, ensuring reliability.	
Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.	The references are adequate and include seminal works like those of Wischmeier and Smith (1978). However, recent advancements in rainfall erosivity estimation, such as studies using machine learning techniques (e.g., Suhara et al., 2023), could be expanded to strengthen the context and relevance of the study. Adding a few recent references on artificial intelligence applications in soil erosion modeling may enhance the manuscript.	

Review Form 3

<p>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>	<p>The language quality is suitable for scholarly communication, though minor grammatical corrections and sentence restructuring could improve readability. Phrases like "highly significant linear correlation" could be rephrased for smoother flow, and transitions between sections could be more coherent.</p>	
<p>Optional/General comments</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The methodology is well-structured, but the inclusion of a flowchart or diagram summarizing the computation process (EI and PI) would improve clarity. • Consider including visual aids such as graphs to depict the correlation between erosion and precipitation indices for better comprehension. • Discussing broader implications, such as how these findings can influence regional policy on soil conservation, would increase the impact of the manuscript. <p>Justification: The text is structured according to the classic scientific format (Introduction, Materials and Methods, Results and Discussion, Conclusion), contains references to previous studies, and clearly states the purpose of the work. The author(s) provide equations, describe the method for calculating the erosion index, and thoroughly analyze the resulting relationships.</p> <p>Nevertheless, for the final acceptance of the article, minor revisions are recommended:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Clarify the formatting of references: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Different formats are used in the text (for example, "(Wischmeier, 1959)" and "(Ram Babu et al. 1978)"). It is advisable to unify these references into a single style. ○ Check for consistency in the spelling of authors' names, initials, and publication years. 2. Refine linguistic formulations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ There are minor stylistic and orthographic inaccuracies in the text that can be corrected by careful editing (for instance, sentences with repeated words or missing prepositions). 3. Clarify certain figures and designations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ When mentioning specific values (for example, latitude, longitude, and rainfall intensity), verify that the units of measurement are correct, properly placed, and consistently noted. <p>Overall, the manuscript leaves a favorable impression and can be accepted for publication after making the indicated minor revisions.</p>	

PART 2:

	<p>Reviewer's comment</p>	<p>Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</p>
<p>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</p>	<p><i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i></p>	

Reviewer Details:

<p>Name:</p>	<p>Djalilova Gulnora Tulkunovna</p>
<p>Department, University & Country</p>	<p>National University of Uzbekistan, Uzbekistan</p>