

**Review Form 3**

|                          |                                                                                          |
|--------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">Asian Journal of Environment &amp; Ecology</a>                               |
| Manuscript Number:       | Ms_AJEE_129188                                                                           |
| Title of the Manuscript: | <b>Socioeconomic and Environmental Impact Analysis of Sand Mining in Bone River Flow</b> |
| Type of the Article      |                                                                                          |

**PART 1: Comments**

|                                                                                                                                                                         | <b>Reviewer's comment</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | <b>Author's Feedback</b> <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i> |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</b> | In response to the urgent environmental, economic, and social challenges posed by mining operations, especially sand mining in water bodies, this paper framework aimed at bringing the impacts and concerns of the mining sector towards sustainable practices. Mining activities have historically led to significant environmental degradation, including water contamination and habitat destruction, contributing to climate change and biodiversity loss. Therefore, research must be conducted to expose such an impact on communities, especially smaller ones. Sand mining is one of the most illegal mining activities in the world, and its impact is not well documented. This paper plays a key role in bringing it upfront. The paper is significant, and the analysis of the findings is accurate, but the content must be well presented for external readers. |                                                                                                                                                                            |
| <b>Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</b>                                                                               | Yes, the title is suitable for the paper.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |                                                                                                                                                                            |
| <b>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.</b>      | The abstract is comprehensive and entices the reader to read the manuscript in depth. The context is well-written and reflects the findings of the research.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |                                                                                                                                                                            |
| <b>Is the manuscript scientifically, correct? Please write here.</b>                                                                                                    | Yes, it is scientifically correct, but it lacks much data to support the results presented. I have noted my comments on the significant corrections and additions needed for the paper to be accepted for publication. Authors should review the uploaded manuscript from me to see my comments. Significant changes need to be made.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |                                                                                                                                                                            |
| <b>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.</b>                              | I have noted this in my comments on the manuscript. Many other references can be added to show the paper's significant importance in addition to the knowledge already available. More current research has been done on the impact of mining, which can be cited in the paper.<br><br><ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Samy Andres Leyton-Flor, Kamaljit Sangha, The socio-ecological impacts of mining on the well-being of Indigenous Australians: A systematic review, The Extractive Industries and Society, Volume 17, 2024,</li> <li>2. Yu, H., Zahidi, I., Fai, C.M. et al. Elevating community well-being in mining areas: the proposal of the mining area sustainability index (MASI). Environ Sci Eur 36, 71 (2024). <a href="https://doi.org/10.1186/s12302-024-00895-9">https://doi.org/10.1186/s12302-024-00895-9</a></li> </ol>                        |                                                                                                                                                                            |

**Review Form 3**

|                                                                                              |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |  |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
| <b>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</b> |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |  |
| <b><u>Optional/General</u></b> comments                                                      | I have also attached the manuscript with comments and changes that need to be made to make this manuscript viable for publication. There is a lot of missing content, and the flow is difficult to follow. Significant changes are needed to make it okay to publish. In addition, a sample of the survey questionnaire used for the data collection should be presented as an appendix to this paper. |  |

**PART 2:**

|                                                            |                                                                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                             |
|------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                                                            | <b><u>Reviewer's comment</u></b>                                                    | <b><u>Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</u></b> |
| <b><u>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</u></b> | <b><u>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</u></b> |                                                                                                                                                                                             |

**Reviewer Details:**

|                                                    |                                              |
|----------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------|
| <b><u>Name:</u></b>                                | <b><u>Kwaku Boakye</u></b>                   |
| <b><u>Department, University &amp; Country</u></b> | <b><u>Colorado State University, USA</u></b> |