

**Review Form 3**

Journal Name:	<a href="#">Asian Journal of Environment &amp; Ecology</a>
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJEE_129188
Title of the Manuscript:	Socioeconomic and Environmental Impact Analysis of Sand Mining in Bone River Flow
Type of the Article	

**PART 1: Comments**

	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<b>Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</b>	The research described in the article is quite relevant and complements the database on the impact of the extractive industry in the floodplains of river channels. The author's work used a comprehensive approach to the analysis of the problem of illegal sand mining within the river watershed and in particular in its floodplain area. The combination of socio-economic and environmental methods is quite interesting, although to some extent generalized and without a strong emphasis on certain aspects of the problem. However, this is, to some extent, compensated by references to data provided in the publication of other authors.	
<b>Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</b>	<b>Yes</b>	
<b>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.</b>	In my opinion, to improve the annotation, it would be useful to add the keywords " channel process " or "erosion processes" that are followed in this article.	
<b>Is the manuscript scientifically, correct? Please write here.</b>	Yes	
<b>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.</b>	Yes	
<b>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</b>	Yes, the language of the text is correct enough.	
<b>Optional/General</b> comments	<p>1. It would be advisable to enlarge Figure 1, as it is currently very difficult to read the text.</p> <p>2. It seems to me that there is a mistake in the paragraph «3.1 Results» (a. Sand excavation process). Is a "straw machine" used during the sand mining process? Perhaps some other machine was meant (excavator, etc.).</p> <p>3. In «REFERENCES» there is a mistake, the author's surname is omitted in «S, M. (2012). Bone River Water Quality...».</p>	

**Review Form 3**

**PART 2:**

	<b><u>Reviewer's comment</u></b>	<b><u>Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</u></b>
<b><u>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</u></b>	<b><u>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</u></b>	

**Reviewer Details:**

<b>Name:</b>	<b>Ihor Hnativ</b>
<b>Department, University &amp; Country</b>	<b>Ukrainian National Forestry University, Ukraine</b>