

Review Form 3

Journal Name:	Journal of Experimental Agriculture International
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JEAI_128765
Title of the Manuscript:	EFFECT OF DIFFERENT VARIETIES ON GROWTH AND YIELD OF MAIZE (Zea mays L.) UNDER GIRD REGION OF MADHYA PRADESH
Type of the Article	

General guidelines for the Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guidelines for the Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

<https://r1.reviewerhub.org/general-editorial-policy/>

Important Policies Regarding Peer Review

Peer review Comments Approval Policy: <https://r1.reviewerhub.org/peer-review-comments-approval-policy/>

Benefits for Reviewers: <https://r1.reviewerhub.org/benefits-for-reviewers>

PART 1: Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	This manuscript provides valuable insights into the performance of different maize varieties under the agro-climatic conditions of the Gird region of Madhya Pradesh, contributing to region-specific agricultural knowledge. It highlights the superior growth and yield potential of PRMH-306, which can aid farmers and agronomists in selecting suitable varieties for enhanced productivity and profitability. Additionally, the study addresses critical challenges such as water stress and variety adaptation, offering practical solutions that align with sustainable agricultural practices. By identifying high-yielding and resilient varieties, this research supports efforts to improve food security, optimize resource utilization, and boost regional agricultural economies.	
Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)	suitable	

Review Form 3

<p>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.</p>	<p>Suggestions for Abstract:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Clearly state the main objective of the investigation at the beginning of the abstract to improve focus. • Briefly explain why these particular maize varieties were chosen for the study. • Add specific quantitative data (e.g., growth rates, yield values) to strengthen the conclusion. • Improve sentence flow and clarity, particularly where water stress and growth limitations are mentioned. • Summarize the key findings concisely, focusing on how PRMH-306 outperformed the other varieties in terms of growth, yield, and profitability. • Mention the significance of the findings for future maize production and regional agricultural practices. 	
<p>Is the manuscript scientifically, correct? Please write here.</p>	<p>Suggestions for Improvement</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Language and Clarity: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Rewrite vague or generalized statements like "no cereal crops with such an immense potentiality." ○ Correct grammatical issues: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ "belong to the Poaceae family" → "<i>belonging to the Poaceae family</i>" ▪ "in of the productivity" → "<i>in terms of productivity</i>". Methodology: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Include details on statistical methods used to analyze data (e.g., ANOVA, significance level at $p < 0.05$). ○ Explain the control treatment (e.g., no fertilizers applied, baseline management). Results and Discussion: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Add statistical values (F-values, p-values, LSD values) to reinforce conclusions about significant differences. ○ Ensure consistency in citation formatting. Conclusion: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Add quantitative data to support claims, e.g., "PRMH-306 produced 20% higher grain yield than other varieties." <hr/> <p>Final Assessment The manuscript is scientifically correct in its design, methods, and findings, but it requires improvements in statistical presentation, grammar, clarity, and citation consistency to meet scientific publication standards. If you provide statistical details, I can further refine the manuscript for you.</p>	
<p>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Citation Consistency: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Your references use mixed styles. Some have full journal names, others abbreviate titles, and a few miss key information (e.g., volume, issue, page numbers). ○ Use a consistent citation format (e.g., APA, MLA, or a journal-specified style). Missing or Incomplete Details: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Gangaiah (2008): Incomplete source title (<i>World</i>, 7(3.28):441 does not align with standard journal citations). ○ Enujeke (2013): The DOI or complete page numbers are missing. Verify the journal name and ensure accurate formatting. ○ Sharma et al. (2021): The journal name is missing; it ends abruptly after "Indian." ○ Ghimire et al. (2016): Missing volume and page details for <i>Agrotechnol.</i> Incorrect Formatting: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Some author names are inconsistently presented (e.g., "Ghimire, S. Sherchan, D.P. Andersen, P., ..." should have commas after all authors). ○ Capitalization in article titles is inconsistent: Example: "Effect of variety and practice of cultivation on yield of spring maize" → Use sentence case consistently. <p>Actionable Suggestions</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Use a consistent referencing style (e.g., APA, Chicago, or journal-specific). 2. Double-check missing or incomplete references (e.g., Gangaiah, Sharma et al., Enujeke). 3. Verify journal names, volume/issue numbers, and page ranges to ensure accuracy. 4. Include DOIs or URLs where applicable for online sources. 	

Review Form 3

<p>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>	<p>The English quality of the article is understandable but not yet fully suitable for scholarly communications. Below are specific observations and suggestions to enhance the language quality for clarity, grammar, and professionalism.</p> <hr/> <p>Key Areas for Improvement</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Grammar and Sentence Structure: Some sentences are grammatically incorrect or awkwardly constructed. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Example: "Maize (<i>Zea mays</i> L.) is one of the important cereal crops belong to the Poaceae family..." <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Improved: "Maize (<i>Zea mays</i> L.) is an important cereal crop belonging to the Poaceae family..." Another Example: "There are no cereal crops with such an immense potentiality, so it is called as 'queen of cereals'." <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Improved: "Due to its immense potential, maize is often referred to as the 'queen of cereals.'" <hr/> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Word Choice and Clarity: Avoid repetitive phrases and vague terms. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Example: "The production of maize depends on the correct agronomic practices and right application of inputs..." <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Improved: "Maize production relies on proper agronomic practices and the efficient application of inputs such as fertilizers and improved seed varieties." Transitions and Flow: Improve logical transitions between sentences and sections to ensure smooth readability. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Example: "The correct efficient-spacing and the suitable variety of the region are the best agronomic cultural practices..." <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Improved: "Optimal plant spacing and selecting region-specific maize varieties are crucial agronomic practices for maximizing yield." Redundancy and Conciseness: Eliminate redundant phrases to maintain scholarly precision. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Example: "The medium or late maturing varieties suffer due to water stress at maturity stage." <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Improved: "Medium- or late-maturing varieties often suffer from water stress during the maturity stage." Technical Language: While the article uses technical terms, ensure they are consistently accurate and appropriate for scholarly communication. Consistency in Formatting: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Italicize scientific names (e.g., <i>Zea mays</i>). Standardize the formatting of references and in-text citations. 	
<p>Optional/General comments</p>		

PART 2:

	<p>Reviewer's comment</p>	<p>Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</p>
<p>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</p>	<p><i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i></p>	

Reviewer Details:

<p>Name:</p>	<p>Vinay Dwivedi</p>
<p>Department, University & Country</p>	<p>Amity University, India</p>