

### Review Form 3

Journal Name:	<a href="#">Asian Journal of Soil Science and Plant Nutrition</a>
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJSSPN_124111
Title of the Manuscript:	Nanomaterials for Sustainable Soil Remediation and Contaminant Immobilization
Type of the Article	review

#### **General guidelines for the Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guidelines for the Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

<https://r1.reviewerhub.org/general-editorial-policy/>

#### **Important Policies Regarding Peer Review**

Peer review Comments Approval Policy: <https://r1.reviewerhub.org/peer-review-comments-approval-policy/>

Benefits for Reviewers: <https://r1.reviewerhub.org/benefits-for-reviewers>

## Review Form 3

### PART 1: Review Comments

<b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's Feedback</b> (Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<b>Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</b>	The article is interesting, but it is not relevant to what the title says. It is more focused on the technical-biological aspect of nanomaterials and does not address their relationship with the sustainable remediation of contaminated soils.	
<b>Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</b>	It is not appropriate and rather than recommending a title, I suggest that the authors reconsider whether they are really going to address the issue of sustainability in the field of nanomaterials, which I believe they can do, to provide that contribution that many remediation techniques do not use.	
<b>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.</b>	The abstract needs to add a section on the relationship between nanomaterials and sustainability, since only the word sustainability is mentioned, but there is no proposal as such on how sustainability issues (social, economic and environmental) relate to nanomaterials.	
<b>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</b>	Yes, they are appropriate, but I insist they are not related to the issue of sustainability.	
<b>Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</b>	Technically and scientifically, from a technical-biological perspective, it is adequate, but it is not related to the title, since the topic of sustainability is only briefly addressed.	
<b>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.</b>	From the technical-biological aspect, the references consulted are adequate, but it is necessary to add citations that address the issue of remediation of contaminated soils and its relationship with sustainability.	
<b>Minor</b> REVISION comments		
<b>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</b>	Yes, it is suitable	
<b>Optional/General</b> comments	The article needs to be further developed on the subject of sustainability and the technique of sustainable nanotechnology, and the results of the research need to be written.	

### PART 2:

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b>	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

### Reviewer Details:

Name:	<b>Jose Guadalupe Chan Quijano</b>
Department, University & Country	<b>Centro del Cambio Global y la Sustentabilidad, Mexico</b>

Review Form 3