

Review Form 3

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Case Reports in Surgery
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJCRS_128945
Title of the Manuscript:	Large intra-articular synovial lipoma of the knee: A case report and review of literature
Type of the Article	Case report

General guidelines for the Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guidelines for the Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

<https://r1.reviewerhub.org/general-editorial-policy/>

Important Policies Regarding Peer Review

Peer review Comments Approval Policy: <https://r1.reviewerhub.org/peer-review-comments-approval-policy/>

Benefits for Reviewers: <https://r1.reviewerhub.org/benefits-for-reviewers>

PART 1: Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.		
Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)		
Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.		
Is the manuscript scientifically, correct? Please write here.		
Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.		

Review Form 3

<p>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>		
<p>Optional/General comments</p>	<p>Here's a detailed review of your case report, highlighting errors and areas for improvement:</p> <p>Abstract</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Mistake: "MRI showed an intra-articular lipoma arising from Hoffa's fat pad and suggestive of lipoma." <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Repetition of "lipoma." Awkward phrasing. Correction: "MRI revealed an intra-articular lipoma arising from Hoffa's fat pad." Mistake: "MRI remains the diagnostic modality of choice." <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Needs supporting evidence or citation. Correction: Add a reference to substantiate this claim. <p>Introduction</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Mistake: Inconsistent capitalization and spacing – e.g., "Intra-articular synovial lipoma is rare entity..." <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Correction: "Intra-articular synovial lipoma is a rare entity..." Mistake: "till date" – informal language. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Correction: "to date." Mistake: Inconsistent use of spacing and formatting in citations (e.g., "[1-25]" vs. "[8]"). <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Correction: Use uniform citation formatting. Mistake: Inconsistent punctuation – e.g., missing commas after clauses ("For this rare entity Knee..."). <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Correction: Add appropriate punctuation for clarity. <p>Case Report</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Mistake: "The patient any trauma to the knee in the past." <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Incomplete sentence. Correction: "The patient denied any history of trauma to the knee." Mistake: "The mass of mobile and non-tender." <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Grammatical error. Correction: "The mass was mobile and non-tender." Mistake: "MRI of the knee joint showed a lobulated lesion arising from Hoffa's fat extending antero-laterally..." <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Needs proper punctuation. Correction: "...arising from Hoffa's fat, extending antero-laterally..." Mistake: Inconsistent measurements – "8 cm by 6 cm" vs. "6.3x5.0x7.9 cm." <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Correction: Ensure consistent formatting (e.g., 8 × 6 cm or 6.3 × 5.0 × 7.9 cm). Mistake: "torniquet" is misspelled. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Correction: "tourniquet." <p>Discussion</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Mistake: Inconsistent phrasing – "Pudlowski et al. [8] considers has attributed..." <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Correction: "Pudlowski et al. [8] attributed..." Mistake: "Locking has been reported in for provide case reports..." <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Poorly constructed sentence. Correction: "Locking has been reported in previous case reports..." Mistake: "There have been 2 provide Case reports redness swelling manifested..." <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Grammatical error. Correction: "There have been two case reports of redness and swelling manifested..." Mistake: Inconsistent use of capitalization for "MRI." <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Correction: Ensure "MRI" is capitalized consistently throughout. Mistake: Confusing differential diagnosis section – overlapping descriptions of Hoffa's disease and lipoma arborescence. 	

Review Form 3

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Correction: Streamline and clarify the comparison of the two conditions. <p>Conclusion</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Mistake: "MRI is the gold standard radiological investigation..." <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Needs a supporting reference. ○ Correction: Add a citation to support this claim. <p>Figures</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Mistake: "Figure 3- Intra-op images showing the extent of the swelling arising from the Hoffa's fat and excised well encapsulated mass." <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Improper formatting and grammatical errors. ○ Correction: "Figure 3: Intra-operative images showing the extent of the swelling arising from Hoffa's fat and the excised, well-encapsulated mass." <p>References</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Mistake: Inconsistent formatting of references: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Some references have double periods (e.g., "2.. Hill JA"), while others are missing page numbers or consistent punctuation. ○ Correction: Standardize reference formatting (e.g., use AMA or Vancouver style consistently). 2. Mistake: Redundant citations – e.g., same references cited multiple times in different formats. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Correction: Consolidate and avoid duplications. <p>General Feedback</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Language and Grammar: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Ensure grammatical consistency, particularly with verb tenses and article usage. ○ Avoid redundancy and unnecessary repetition of phrases. 2. Formatting: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Maintain uniform formatting for headings, subheadings, measurements, and citations. 3. References: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Ensure proper formatting of references with complete information (e.g., journal name, volume, page numbers). 4. Clarity: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Improve sentence structure for readability and precision, particularly in the discussion and differential diagnosis sections. 	
--	--	--

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Mohit Sharma
Department, University & Country	S.M.S. Medical College, India