

Review Form 3

Journal Name:	Journal of Education, Society and Behavioural Science
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JESBS_128426
Title of the Manuscript:	Systematic Literature Review on Spiritual Leadership in Tri Hita Karana Philosophy
Type of the Article	manuscript

PART 1: Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<p>Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p>	<p>This systematic literature review focusing on the spiritual leadership aspect of Tri Hita Karana philosophy makes a significant contribution to the management studies. Since the given idea embraces spirituality in leadership, this work gives a fresh view on the concept through focusing on Balance in the framework of the Balinese culture. It is considered that the core values and principles of Tri Hita Karana are outlined in the context of the review therefore it has provided a great source of information for the researcher and practitioner regarding developing meaningful and sustainable organization.</p> <p>Combing the detailed literature review of spiritual leadership with the discussion of the Tri Hita Karana philosophy in the context of the present study underlines the possibilities of a more systemic perspective on leadership. This research can make a small but highly informative contribution to the generation of new models of leadership that respect ethical conduct, social responsibility, and environmental sustainability. Consequently, by relying on the knowledge from the times that have passed, this review provides a rather appropriate insight into the future of leadership.</p>	
<p>Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p>	<p>The suggested title, SYSTEMATIC LITERATURE REVIEW ON SPIRITUAL LEADERSHIP IN TRI HITA KARANA PHILOSOPHY can be deemed appropriate and describes exactly what the research is all about. The research method is presented obviously as systematic literature review and the focus area is also mentioned clearly as Spiritual leadership within Tri Hita Karana.</p> <p>However, to further enhance the title's impact and clarity, you could consider alternative options like these ones:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) A Systematic Review of Spiritual Leadership Practices Rooted in Tri Hita Karana Philosophy 2) Spiritual Leadership and Tri Hita Karana: A Systematic Review. 	

Review Form 3

<p>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.</p>	<p>The abstract is generally comprehensive, providing a clear overview of the research topic, objectives, methodology, and key findings. However, there are a few areas where it could be improved:</p> <p>Suggestions:</p> <p>Strengthen the Research Question: The abstract could benefit from a more specific research question. While the overall aim is clear, a focused question would enhance the clarity and direction of the study. For example: "How can spiritual leadership principles, rooted in the Tri Hita Karana philosophy, be applied to modern organizations in Bali?"</p> <p>Highlight the Unique Contribution: The abstract should emphasize the unique contribution of the study. Consider adding a sentence that highlights the novelty of the research, such as: "This study pioneers the exploration of spiritual leadership within the framework of Tri Hita Karana philosophy."</p> <p>Elaborate on the Practical Implications: While the abstract mentions practical implications, it could be further elaborated. Consider adding a brief statement about the potential benefits of applying the findings to real-world organizational settings, such as improved employee engagement, organizational performance, and social responsibility.</p>	
<p>Is the manuscript scientifically, correct? Please write here.</p>	<p>The manuscript employs a systematic literature review to analyze Spiritual Leadership through the lens of Tri Hita Karana, a Balinese philosophy of harmony. This approach is scientifically valid for synthesizing existing research and aligning theoretical constructs with a cultural framework.</p>	
<p>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.</p>	<p>The provided references offer a robust foundation for exploring spiritual leadership, particularly within the frameworks of Hindu philosophy and organizational studies. Some references are relatively recent, such as Samul (2020) and Sibanda & Grobler (2024), reflecting contemporary research.</p> <p>However, several older sources, such as Fry (2003), Mitroff & Denton (1999), and Hawley (1993), although foundational, could be supplemented with more current studies to reflect advancements in the field.</p> <p>Some authors appear multiple times with slightly different references (e.g., Javanmard, H. in 2012a and 2012b). This redundancy could be consolidated to avoid confusion.</p>	
<p>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>	<p>The in-text citations should be consistently formatted according to APA 7th edition or another accepted academic style. For instance, citations should be incorporated into the flow of the sentence rather than beginning with the citation itself. An appropriate format would be: "Fry (2008) suggests..." or "According to Fry (2008), ...". Starting a sentence with a citation like "(Rafsanjani et al., 2017)" is not in line with APA 7th edition or most other academic citation styles.</p>	
<p>Optional/General comments</p>	<p>The researcher should declare both competing interests and ethical considerations. Competing interests should be disclosed to ensure transparency regarding any potential biases. Ethical considerations should address the impact of spiritual leadership on employees' well-being and ensure its implementation does not manipulate or pressure individuals into aligning with specific beliefs. This will enhance the credibility and integrity of the study.</p> <p>Given the focus on Tri Hita Karana philosophy, the researcher should ensure cultural sensitivity in the implementation of these principles in diverse organizational settings, considering the diverse religious and cultural backgrounds of employees.</p> <p>The author's personal or professional alignment with a particular spiritual or leadership framework, such as the Tri Hita Karana philosophy, could lead to potential bias in interpreting the data or framing conclusions, especially if the author stands to gain from promoting such a framework. That is why it is recommended that the researcher declare any potential conflicts of interest related to personal beliefs, professional affiliations, or financial interests that may influence the research outcomes. This declaration would enhance the manuscript's credibility, ensuring transparency and impartiality in the presentation of the findings.</p>	

Review Form 3

PART 2:

	<u>Reviewer's comment</u>	<u>Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</u>
<u>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</u>	<u>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</u>	

Reviewer Details:

<u>Name:</u>	Bbaale Benjamin
<u>Department, University & Country</u>	Makerere University, Uganda