

Review Form 3

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Research in Surgery
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJRS_120350
Title of the Manuscript:	A Giant Intra-Abdominal Small Intestinal desmoid tumor – A rare case report
Type of the Article	Case report

Review Form 3

PART 1: Review Comments

Compulsory REVISION comments	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<p>Please write few sentences regarding the importance this manuscript for scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? Minimum 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p>	<p>This manuscript presents a rare case of a giant intra-abdominal desmoid tumour originating from the small intestine. It is valuable for the scientific community for several reasons:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Primary desmoid tumours of the small intestine are extremely uncommon, making this case report significant for expanding the literature on such rare presentations. 2. The case provides detailed clinical, radiological, and surgical information that can guide other clinicians in diagnosing and managing similar cases. 3. The authors have conducted a comprehensive literature review, synthesizing information from 56 publications over four decades, which adds context and depth to the case report. 4. The successful surgical management without the need for radiation or chemotherapy offers insights into potential treatment strategies for similar cases. <p>I like the manuscript for its clear presentation of the case, comprehensive literature review, and discussion of diagnostic and treatment approaches. However, the manuscript could benefit from more detailed discussion of long-term follow-up strategies and potential complications.</p>	
<p>Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p>	<p>The title "A Giant Intra-Abdominal Small Intestinal desmoid tumor – A rare case report" is suitable as it accurately describes the content of the manuscript.</p>	
<p>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.</p>	<p>The abstract is relatively comprehensive, covering key points such as the rarity of the condition, clinical presentation, imaging modalities used, and treatment approach. However, there are some suggestions for improvement:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Add a brief mention of the patient's outcome and follow-up duration. 2. Include the size and weight of the resected tumour. 3. Mention the histopathological findings and immunohistochemistry results. 4. Consider adding a brief statement about the importance of long-term follow-up due to the high recurrence rate of desmoid tumours. 	
<p>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p>	<p>The overall structure of the manuscript is generally appropriate, following a logical flow from introduction to case report to discussion.</p>	
<p>Please write few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? Minimum 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p>	<p>The manuscript appears scientifically correct and technically sound for several reasons:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The case report provides detailed clinical information, including patient history, physical examination findings, and diagnostic imaging results. 2. The surgical approach and histopathological findings are clearly described, providing crucial information for confirming the diagnosis and treatment efficacy. 3. The literature review synthesizes information from a large number of sources, demonstrating a thorough exploration of existing knowledge on desmoid tumours. 4. The discussion section accurately describes the epidemiology, risk factors, and genetic associations of desmoid tumours. 5. The manuscript correctly emphasizes the importance of immunohistochemistry in differentiating desmoid tumours from other spindle cell neoplasms, particularly gastrointestinal stromal tumours. 	
<p>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</p> <p>=</p>	<p>The manuscript includes 11 references, which is a reasonable number for a case report. However, there are some concerns and suggestions:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The references span from 2004 to 2023, with the majority from the last five years, indicating a good mix of established knowledge and recent findings. 2. The references appear relevant to the topic, covering various aspects of desmoid tumours including epidemiology, diagnosis, and treatment. 3. Given that the authors mention reviewing 56 publications, including more of these in the reference 	

Review Form 3

	list could provide a more comprehensive background. Including more high-quality references would strengthen the manuscript.	
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?	The overall language quality of the manuscript is generally suitable for scholarly work, but there are several areas that could be improved: 1. The manuscript would benefit from thorough proofreading to address grammatical errors, typos, and punctuation issues. 2. Standardizing the formatting, especially in the references section, would improve the overall presentation. 3. Ensuring consistent tense usage throughout the manuscript would improve readability.	
<u>Optional/General</u> comments		

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Savvas Lampridis
Department, University & Country	Imperial College, UK