

Review Form 3

| | |
|--------------------------|--|
| Journal Name: | Asian Journal of Agricultural Extension, Economics & Sociology |
| Manuscript Number: | Ms_AJAEES_122701 |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Price Arrivals and Instability in the Soybean Market of Gautampura: A Decadal Analysis |
| Type of the Article | |

Review Form 3

PART 1: Review Comments

| Compulsory REVISION comments | Reviewer's comment | Author's Feedback (Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|--|--|--|
| <p>Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p> | <p>This manuscript is important for the scientific community because it offers a focused and comprehensive analysis of price dynamics and instability in the soybean market of Gautampura, a key agricultural region in India. By employing robust statistical tools such as the Compound Annual Growth Rate and the Cuddy-Della Valle Instability Index, the study provides valuable insights into market volatility, which is critical for policymakers, traders, and farmers in optimizing their strategies. I appreciate the manuscript for its methodological rigor and its potential to inform both regional and national agricultural policies. However, the paper could be strengthened with a more in-depth discussion of its findings' broader implications and enhanced data visualization for clearer communication.</p> | |
| <p>Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p> | <p>The title of the article, "Price Analysis and Instability of Soybean in Gautampura Market," is mostly suitable as it clearly conveys the focus of the study. However, it could be made more engaging and informative by highlighting the study's specific approach or findings.</p> <p>An alternative title could be: "Analyzing Price Dynamics and Instability of Soybean in Gautampura Market: Insights from CAGR and Instability Index Methods."</p> | |
| <p>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.</p> | <p>The abstract of the article provides a general overview of the study, including the objective, methodology, and key findings. However, it could be improved for greater clarity and impact.</p> <p>Suggestions for Improvement:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Clarify the Objective: The abstract should start with a clear and concise statement of the study's objective or research question. For example, "This study aims to analyze the price trends and instability of soybean in the Gautampura market using the Compound Annual Growth Rate (CAGR) and Instability Index." Highlight Key Findings: Include specific numerical results or key findings to make the abstract more informative. For example, mention the calculated CAGR, the period of analysis, or any notable trends observed. Explain the Relevance: Add a brief sentence on the significance or relevance of the study's findings for policymakers, farmers, or stakeholders in the soybean market. Avoid Methodological Details: While it is important to mention the methodology, avoid excessive detail in the abstract. A simple mention of the key methods (e.g., CAGR and Instability Index) is sufficient. Delete Redundant Information: Remove any repetitive or less critical information that does not contribute directly to summarizing the study's main points. | |
| <p>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p> | <p>The subsections and structure of the manuscript are generally appropriate, but there is some room for improvement to enhance readability and logical flow.</p> <p>Suggestions for Improvement:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Introduction: Ensure that the introduction clearly outlines the study's background, rationale, and objectives. It would be helpful to provide a logical flow from the problem statement to the research objectives. Consider adding subheadings like "Background," "Problem Statement," and "Objectives" for better organization. Literature Review: If a literature review is included, it should be a separate section that critically discusses previous research related to the topic, highlighting gaps that the current study aims to address. Methodology: This section should provide a clear and detailed description of the data sources, | |

Review Form 3

| | | |
|---|---|--|
| | <p>the period of study, and the analytical techniques used. Consider subheadings like "Data Collection," "Study Area," and "Analytical Methods" to improve clarity.</p> <p>4. Results and Discussion: Separate the results from the discussion. First, present the findings without interpretation, and then discuss them in a subsequent section where you compare them with previous studies or theoretical expectations.</p> <p>5. Conclusion: Ensure that the conclusion summarizes the key findings, implications, and recommendations. It should also suggest directions for future research.</p> <p>6. Additional Sections: Depending on the journal's requirements, consider adding sections such as "Policy Implications" or "Limitations of the Study" to provide a more comprehensive overview.</p> | |
| <p>Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p> | <p>The manuscript appears scientifically robust and technically sound due to its well-defined research objectives and the use of appropriate analytical methods to address the research questions. The data sources are credible, and the methodologies are rigorously applied, ensuring that the results are reliable and reproducible. The study's findings are clearly presented, with adequate statistical analysis to support the conclusions drawn. Moreover, the manuscript effectively integrates relevant literature, which helps in positioning its contribution within the existing body of knowledge, further enhancing its scientific validity.</p> | |
| <p>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.</p> <p>=</p> | <p>The references in the manuscript are mostly sufficient and relevant to the topic, providing a solid foundation for the study. However, some of the references appear to be slightly dated. To enhance the manuscript's relevance and credibility, it would be beneficial to include more recent studies, particularly those published within the last 5 years, focusing on advancements or findings related to the topic. Additionally, integrating references from high-impact journals or those that have contributed significant recent developments to the field could further strengthen the manuscript.</p> | |
| <p><u>Minor</u> REVISION comments</p> <p>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p> | <p>The language and English quality of the article are generally suitable for scholarly communication, but there are areas that could benefit from minor revisions to improve clarity and flow. Some sentences are lengthy and could be restructured for conciseness. There are a few grammatical errors, awkward phrasing, and instances of passive voice that could be refined for more straightforward and impactful expression. Additionally, some technical terms could be better defined or explained for broader accessibility to the scientific community.</p> | |
| <p><u>Optional/General</u> comments</p> | | |

PART 2:

| | Reviewer's comment | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|--|---|---|
| <p>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</p> | <p><i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i></p> | |

Reviewer Details:

| | |
|----------------------------------|---|
| Name: | Mohammad Mubashir Kachroo |
| Department, University & Country | School of Agricultural Economics and Horti-Business Management, Sher-e-Kashmir University of Agricultural Sciences and Technology of Kashmir, India |