

**Review Form 3**

Journal Name:	<b>Journal of Experimental Agriculture International</b>
Manuscript Number:	<b>Ms_JEAI_123506</b>
Title of the Manuscript:	<b>Evaluation of phyto-extracts for the management of alternaria leaf spot of black gram (Vigna mungo L.) caused by Alternaria alternata (Fr.) Keissler</b>
Type of the Article	

## Review Form 3

### PART 1: Review Comments

<b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's Feedback</b> (Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	In the era of organic/ natural farming the plant extracts taken into consideration is the good concept. Also now a day's people are also health conscious and focus on the organic food and vegetables without pesticide residue. So this research will help definitely in managing the disease without pesticides and also in developing the integrated disease management approach.	
Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)	Yes	
Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.	Correct the grammatical errors.	
Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?	Yes	
Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	The latest area, production and productivity data should be mentioned of India as well as of respective state. The preparation of phyto-extracts should be mentioned in detail. The description of material and methods is not proper, as three sprays are mentioned while the data in table and results describes only two spray, so what is actual carried out. Another is the calculation of ICB ratio should be mentioned in tabular form. Author should justify about the ICB ratio of neem leaf extract as neem leaves does not have price as like garlic, ginger. As leaves of neem can be availed free of cost so returns in case of neem leaf extract should be double or more as in case of garlic and ginger. The transformation method should be described by author if carried out.	
Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.	Yes	
<b>Minor</b> REVISION comments	No	
Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?		
<b>Optional/General</b> comments	Research work carried out is good but justification is much needed in the writing about the results of experiments as this is for scientific community. There are also certain grammatical mistakes in manuscript which should be avoided.	

### PART 2:

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

### Review Form 3

**Reviewer Details:**

Name:	<b>Bhadani Monik Nandlal</b>
Department, University & Country	<b>Anand Agricultural University, India</b>