

Review Form 3

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Agricultural Extension, Economics & Sociology
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJAEES_122373
Title of the Manuscript:	Costs and Profit Assessment of Layer Eggs Farming in Punjab
Type of the Article	

Review Form 3

PART 1: Review Comments

Compulsory REVISION comments	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<p>Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p>	<p>This manuscript provides valuable empirical data on the economics and profitability of layer egg production in Punjab, India. The cost and return analysis across different farm sizes offers important insights for poultry farmers, policymakers, and researchers. The findings on economies of scale and output-input ratios are particularly useful for understanding the economic viability of layer farming at different scales. Overall, this study makes a meaningful contribution to the literature on poultry economics in India.</p>	
<p>Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p>	<p>The title "Costs and Profit Assessment of Layer Eggs Farming in Punjab" is suitable and accurately reflects the content of the manuscript. It clearly indicates the focus on economic analysis of layer egg production in the specific region of Punjab.</p>	
<p>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.</p>	<p>The abstract is comprehensive and covers the key aspects of the study including objectives, methodology, and main findings. I suggest adding a brief sentence on policy implications to make it more complete.</p>	
<p>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p>	<p>The manuscript has an appropriate structure with clear subsections covering introduction, methodology, results and discussion, and conclusion. The flow of information is logical.</p>	
<p>Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p>	<p>The study appears scientifically robust in its methodology and analysis. The use of primary data from 100 layer farms selected through probability sampling lends credibility to the findings. The cost-return analysis and profitability indicators like output-input ratios are appropriate for assessing economic viability. The break-even analysis provides useful insights. Overall, the quantitative analysis seems sound and the conclusions are supported by the data.</p>	
<p>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.</p>	<p>The references cited are sufficient and relatively recent. Some additional recent references on poultry economics in India could further strengthen the literature review.</p>	

Review Form 3

<p><u>Minor REVISION</u> comments</p> <p>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>	<p>The language quality is generally suitable for scholarly communication, though some minor grammatical and phrasing improvements could be made to enhance readability.</p>	
<p><u>Optional/General</u> comments</p>	<p>The manuscript provides valuable empirical insights on layer egg economics in Punjab and is methodologically sound. Some minor revisions to improve language and add recent references could further enhance its quality.</p> <p>Introduction: provide more context on the importance of the poultry industry in Punjab specifically, not just India as a whole.</p> <p>Literature Review: Include more recent studies (2020-2023) on poultry economics, if available.</p> <p>Method:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Farm size categorization: The authors use the Cumulative Square Root Frequency Method to categorize farms into small, medium, and large. It would be beneficial to provide more details on how this method was applied and why it was chosen over other potential categorization methods. 2. Statistical testing: The study presents descriptive statistics and comparisons across farm sizes, but lacks statistical tests to determine if differences between categories are significant. 3. Comparative analysis: Comparing the results with similar studies from other regions in India or other countries could provide context and highlight unique aspects of Punjab's layer farming sector. <p>Results and Discussion:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Discuss potential reasons for the differences observed between small, medium, and large farms. 2. Discuss any seasonal variations in costs or returns, if such data is available. <p>Conclusion and Policy Implications:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Expand on policy implications - be more specific about what kinds of policies could address the issues identified. 2. Discuss potential future trends in the layer farming sector based on the findings. 3. Add recommendations for farmers based on the profitability analysis across farm sizes. <p>Tables and Figures:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Consider adding a map of Punjab showing the distribution of sampled farms. 2. A flowchart illustrating the egg production process could be helpful for readers less familiar with layer farming. 3. Add error bars to figures where applicable to show variability in the data. 	

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</p>	<p><i>(If yes. Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i></p>	

Reviewer Details:

<p>Name:</p>	<p>Mohd Mahmud</p>
<p>Department, University & Country</p>	<p>Universiti Malaysia Kelantan, Malaysia</p>