

**Review Form 3**

|                          |  |
|--------------------------|--|
| Journal Name:            | <b>Journal of Experimental Agriculture International</b>   |
| Manuscript Number:       | <b>Ms_JEAI_122235</b>  |
| Title of the Manuscript: | <b>Genetic variability and character association studies in trait specific safflower (<i>Carthamus tinctorius</i> L.) germplasm lines.</b> |
| Type of the Article      |  |

### Review Form 3

#### **PART 1:** Review Comments

| <u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments  | Reviewer's comment   | Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i> |
|--|--|---|
| <b>Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</b>                        | The work makes a positive contribution to the scientific community, for research in this area was observed to be lacking or very limited especially for the neglected crop safflower. Interestingly, the manuscript was well structured and had few typos which made it easy to read and follow. In the introduction, citations of recent research related to the topic were not adequately described though they are critical in identifying research gaps.   |   |
| <b>Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</b>  | The title of the manuscript is suitable for the content.   |   |
| <b>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.</b>   | The abstract is adequately written. However, the use of abbreviations without first defining them maybe be avoided in the abstract as it becomes difficult to understand.  |   |
| <b>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</b>  | The subsections and structure of the manuscript are organized in a clear way which made it easier to follow.   |   |
| <b>Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</b> | The manuscript is well prepared with convincing academic arguments. The experiment was well laid out and data scientifically collected and analyzed. Findings were interpreted in a professional manner however, the implications of some results (e.g in the 2 <sup>nd</sup> and 4 <sup>th</sup> paragraph of the results and discussion section) were not sufficiently discussed for some genetic variability parameters. More citations need to be included in the introduction section to show that recent research related to the topic were not described. The conclusion was sufficiently written as it reflected upon the aims of the study. |   |
| <b>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.</b>   | The references used are sufficient however, under the introduction section one or two sentences of literature review may be added to show readers what research has already been done in relation to the studied parameters.   |   |
| <u>Minor</u> REVISION comments   |  |   |
| <b>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</b>   | The English used in this manuscript is readable and suitable for scholarly communication   |   |
| <u>Optional/General</u> comments   |  |   |

#### **PART 2:**

|   | Reviewer's comment   | Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i> |
|---|--|--|
| <b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b> | <i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i> |  |

**Review Form 3**

**Reviewer Details:**

|                                  |   |
|----------------------------------|---|
| Name:                            | <b>Marang Mosupiemang</b>   |
| Department, University & Country | <b>Botswana University of Agriculture and Natural Resources, Botswana</b> |