

Review Form 3

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Environment & Ecology
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJEE_121883
Title of the Manuscript:	Integrating Circular Economy Principles in Urban Development for Sustainable Cities in Nigeria
Type of the Article	

Review Form 3

PART 1: Review Comments

Compulsory REVISION comments	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<p>Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p>	<p>This manuscript, "Integrating Circular Economy Principles in Urban Development for Sustainable Cities in Nigeria," addresses a critical and timely topic. The integration of Circular Economy (CE) principles offers promising solutions to urbanization challenges such as waste management, resource scarcity, and environmental degradation, which are pressing issues in Nigeria. By incorporating global and local case studies, including Lebanon's adaptation to CE amidst its economic crisis, the paper provides valuable insights and strategic recommendations that can inform policymakers and urban planners. The relevance and applicability of the research to real-world challenges make it a significant contribution to the scientific community, advancing our understanding of sustainable urban development in rapidly urbanizing regions.</p>	
<p>Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p>	<p>The current title, "Integrating Circular Economy Principles in Urban Development for Sustainable Cities in Nigeria," effectively conveys the main focus of the manuscript. However, to make it more engaging and emphasize the practical implications, it might consider a slightly modified title:</p> <p>"Implementing Circular Economy Principles for Sustainable Urban Development in Nigeria: Lessons from Global and Local Case Studies"</p> <p>This alternative title highlights both the action ("Implementing") and the sources of insight ("Lessons from Global and Local Case Studies"), which may attract more interest from readers.</p>	
<p>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.</p>	<p>The abstract of the article is comprehensive and covers the main points effectively. However, to enhance clarity and ensure all key aspects are succinctly mentioned, consider the following suggestions:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Emphasize the significance of the problem: Clearly state why the urbanization challenges in Nigeria are critical. 2. Highlight the methodology briefly: Mention the mixed-methods approach and the use of case studies. 3. 	
<p>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p>	<p>The subsections and structure of the manuscript appear to be appropriate and well-organized, covering essential components of the research. However, a few adjustments could enhance clarity and flow:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Ensuring the structure follows a logical progression from problem identification to solutions and recommendations. 2. Some subsections could be consolidated to avoid redundancy and improve coherence. 3. 	
<p>Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p>	<p>This manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound due to its comprehensive and methodical approach to integrating Circular Economy (CE) principles in urban development. The use of a mixed-methods approach, combining qualitative and quantitative data, ensures a thorough analysis of the topic. The manuscript's reliance on relevant case studies from both global and local perspectives, such as Lagos, Amsterdam, Cape Town, and Beirut, provides a strong empirical foundation for its recommendations. Additionally, the literature review is detailed, covering key concepts, theoretical frameworks, and practical implementations, which substantiates the manuscript's arguments and findings. The integration of diverse sources and case studies adds to the scientific rigor and credibility of the research.</p>	
<p>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.</p>	<p>The references in the manuscript are generally sufficient and include a mix of seminal works and recent studies relevant to Circular Economy (CE) and sustainable urban development. However, to enhance the comprehensiveness and relevance of the literature, here are a few</p>	

Review Form 3

:	<p>suggestions for additional references:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Kirchherr, J., Piscicelli, L., Bour, R., Kostense-Smit, E., Muller, J., Huibrechtse-Truijens, A., & Hekkert, M. (2018). Barriers to the Circular Economy: Evidence from the European Union (EU). <i>Ecological Economics</i>, 150, 264-272. doi:10.1016/j.ecolecon.2018.04.028. 2. Ghisellini, P., Ripa, M., & Ulgiati, S. (2018). Exploring environmental and economic costs and benefits of a circular economy approach to the construction and demolition sector. A literature review. <i>Journal of Cleaner Production</i>, 178, 618-643. 	
<p><u>Minor</u> REVISION comments</p> <p>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>	<p>The language and English quality of the article are generally suitable for scholarly communications. The manuscript is well-written, with clear and coherent sentences that effectively convey the concepts and findings.</p>	
<p><u>Optional/General</u> comments</p>		

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</p>	<p><i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i></p>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Bikram Rawat
Department, University & Country	Nepal Engineering College, Nepal