

Review Form 3

Journal Name:	Journal of Experimental Agriculture International
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JEAI_122246
Title of the Manuscript:	Zero-Tillage Farming Contributes To Improved Yield and Soil Health
Type of the Article	

Review Form 3

PART 1: Review Comments

<u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<p>Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p>	<p>This manuscript addresses an important topic by exploring Zero-Tillage (ZT) farming's role in enhancing agricultural productivity, soil health, and environmental sustainability. While it provides a broad overview and integrates recent technological advancements, the manuscript lacks in-depth critical analysis in certain areas. The review could benefit from a more detailed examination of the limitations and variability in ZT's effectiveness across different regions and soil types. This would provide a more nuanced understanding of ZT's practical applications and constraints, thus enhancing its relevance to the scientific community and agricultural practitioners.</p>	
<p>Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p>	<p>The current title, "Zero-Tillage Farming Contributes To Improved Yield and Soil Health," is somewhat not sound good and does not fully capture the scope of the manuscript. A more precise title would be: "Evaluating the Impact of Zero-Tillage Farming on Crop Yields, Soil Health, and Environmental Sustainability: Advances, Challenges, and Future Directions." This revision emphasizes the manuscript's focus on both the advancements and challenges associated with ZT, offering a clearer picture of its comprehensive nature.</p>	
<p>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.</p>	<p>The abstract provides a general overview but lacks specific details about the critical evaluation of Zero-Tillage farming. Some suggestions: A summary of the specific technological innovations discussed An overview of the main criticisms or limitations of ZT highlighted in the review. A brief mention of key recommendations or future research directions. These additions would provide a more complete snapshot of the manuscript's content and its contribution to the field.</p>	
<p>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p>	<p>The "Methods of Zero Tillage" section should be consolidated with the discussion on its impact to present a unified view of how ZT techniques affect outcomes. The "Criticisms and Controversies" section should be more prominently placed to reflect a balanced view and follow the discussion of ZT's benefits and impacts.</p>	
<p>Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p>	<p>The manuscript is fundamentally sound but would benefit from a deeper critical analysis of the variability in ZT's effectiveness. The discussion on ZT's impact on productivity and soil health could be enhanced by integrating more detailed case studies or meta-analyses to illustrate varying outcomes in different environments.</p>	
<p>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.</p>	<p>While the references are generally adequate, they need updating to include more recent studies.</p>	
<p><u>Minor</u> REVISION comments</p> <p>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>	<p>The language is mostly suitable but requires refinement for clarity and precision. Specific suggestions include: Simplifying complex phrases and reducing jargon where possible to make the text more accessible.</p>	
<p><u>Optional/General</u> comments</p>	<p>Overall, while the manuscript makes a valuable contribution to the field of agricultural sustainability, it requires more critical analysis and detailed examination of Zero-Tillage farming's diverse impacts.</p>	

Review Form 3

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Mukesh Kumar Meena
Department, University & Country	ICAR- Indian Institute of Soil and Water Conservation, India