

**Review Form 3**

Journal Name:	<a href="#">Journal of Scientific Research and Reports</a>
Manuscript Number:	<b>Ms_JSRR_121087</b>
Title of the Manuscript:	<b>An economic analysis of Production and maintenance cost of per milch animal Buffaloes of Ghazipur district of Uttar Pradesh</b>
Type of the Article	

**Review Form 3**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

<b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's Feedback</b> <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<p><b>Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</b></p>	<p>The manuscript provides a thorough economic analysis of milk production and maintenance costs for milch buffaloes in Ghazipur District, Uttar Pradesh. This research is significant for the scientific community as it explores the dynamics of milk marketing and the factors influencing milk production costs, which are crucial for developing effective agricultural policies. By categorizing cattle owners and examining demographic trends, the study contributes valuable insights into optimizing milk marketing strategies and improving efficiency in dairy farming. Such data can aid in enhancing the economic conditions of small and marginal farmers, thereby supporting rural development and self-reliance in the agricultural sector.</p> <p>I appreciate this manuscript because it employs a descriptive and analytical approach, providing comprehensive data that can inform future research and policy-making in dairy farming. The detailed breakdown of production costs, including labor, veterinary charges, and feed expenses, offers a clear picture of the economic challenges faced by different categories of cattle owners. However, the manuscript could benefit from a broader geographical scope or comparisons with other regions to enrich its findings and applicability in diverse contexts. Overall, its focus on practical issues in dairy farming makes it a valuable resource for stakeholders in the agricultural sector.</p>	
<p><b>Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</b></p>	<p>Clarity: The title clearly indicates the focus on economic analysis and specifies the subject (production and maintenance costs) and the geographical location (Ghazipur district, Uttar Pradesh).            Specificity: It precisely defines the scope of the study, which is crucial for readers interested in dairy economics or regional studies in India.            Keywords: It includes relevant keywords such as "economic analysis," "production," "maintenance cost," and "buffaloes," which are likely to attract the appropriate audience.            Suggested Alternative Titles</p> <p>While the current title is suitable, here are a few alternative suggestions that could enhance its appeal or clarity:            "Economic Assessment of Buffalo Milch Animal Production Costs in Ghazipur, Uttar Pradesh"            "Cost Analysis of Milch Buffalo Production in Uttar Pradesh's Ghazipur District"            "Evaluating Production and Maintenance Costs for Buffaloes in Ghazipur, Uttar Pradesh"            "A Comprehensive Economic Study of Milch Animal Costs in Ghazipur District"            "Insights into the Economic Aspects of Buffalo Production in Ghazipur, Uttar Pradesh"</p> <p>Conclusion            The title is generally suitable as it conveys the essential elements of the study. However, the suggested alternatives may help in better capturing the reader's interest and enhancing clarity.</p>	

**Review Form 3**

<p><b>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.</b></p>	<p>The abstract of the article comprehensively outlines the primary objectives and methodologies of the study, which focuses on milk marketing dynamics in the Gazipur District of Uttar Pradesh. It covers the following key points:          Examination of different milk marketing channels.          Categorization of cattle owners.          Investigation of demographic trends among cattle owners.          Analysis of how demographics correlate with milk marketing strategies and efficiency.          Description of the research design as descriptive and analytical.          Focus on the cost of milk production.          Survey methodology and classification of cattle owners into small, medium, and large-scale operations.          Comprehensive data collection approach through direct interviews.  <b>Suggestions for Improvement</b>          While the abstract is largely comprehensive, a few suggestions for enhancement include:  <b>Clarification of Objectives:</b> More explicitly state the expected outcomes of the study and the significance of understanding milk marketing dynamics.  <b>Inclusion of Key Findings:</b> Summarizing preliminary findings or insights could provide readers with a clearer understanding of the study's impact.  <b>Methodological Details:</b> Briefly mention the sample size and demographic diversity of the surveyed cattle owners to enhance credibility.  <b>Contextual Background:</b> Adding a sentence about the importance of dairy farming in Uttar Pradesh could help frame the study's relevance.  <b>Implications of Findings:</b> Discuss potential implications for policy or practice within the dairy sector to emphasize the study's practical contributions.  <b>Limitations:</b> Acknowledging any limitations of the study within the abstract could provide a balanced view.  <b>Terminology Explanation:</b> Define key terms like "Atmanirbhar" for clarity, especially for readers unfamiliar with local terminology.  <b>Keywords Expansion:</b> Consider adding a few more keywords to reflect the breadth of the study, such as "demographics," "milk production costs," and "market efficiency."          By implementing these suggestions, the abstract could better capture the essence and significance of the research, thus appealing to a wider audience interested in dairy economics and rural development.  <b>References</b>          The analysis and suggestions are based on the detailed examination of the document excerpts related to the study's content and objectives</p>	
<p><b>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</b></p>	<p>The manuscript structure and subsections play a crucial role in presenting research findings clearly and effectively. In reviewing the content related to milk production and marketing in Uttar Pradesh, the following points highlight the appropriateness of the manuscript's subsections and structure:  <b>Clear Objective:</b> The primary objective is well-defined, focusing on milk marketing dynamics and cost analysis in specific districts, which sets a clear direction for the research.  <b>Methodological Rigor:</b> The manuscript employs a descriptive and analytical design, detailing the methodology used for data collection, including surveys and categorization of cattle owners based on scale of operation.  <b>Data Presentation:</b> Results and discussions are organized with clear headings and subsections, such as the breakdown of production and maintenance costs per milch animal, allowing for easy navigation and comprehension.  <b>Categorization of Data:</b> The classification of cattle owners into small, medium, and large-scale operations provides a structured approach to analyzing demographic trends and marketing strategies.  <b>Comprehensive Results:</b> The results section includes detailed tables showcasing cost components and averages, enhancing the clarity of findings.  <b>Contextual Relevance:</b> The manuscript connects the findings to broader trends in the dairy industry, such as the impact of agricultural policies and market dynamics, which enriches the context of the research.  <b>Regional Analysis:</b> The focus on specific districts allows for localized insights, addressing the unique challenges faced by dairy farmers in different socio-economic contexts.  <b>Conclusions and Recommendations:</b> The manuscript concludes with implications for improving dairy farming and marketing practices, which is crucial for practical application of the research.  <b>Recommendations for Improvement</b></p>	

**Review Form 3**

	<p>While the structure and subsections are largely appropriate, the following improvements could enhance clarity:  <b>Introduction Enhancement:</b> A more detailed introduction could better outline the significance of the study and the research questions being addressed.  <b>Visual Aids:</b> Incorporating more charts or graphs could visually represent data trends and enhance understanding.  <b>Literature Review Section:</b> A dedicated literature review could contextualize the research within existing studies, showcasing gaps that the current research aims to fill.  <b>Consolidation of Findings:</b> Summarizing key findings in a singular section could help reinforce the main conclusions drawn from the research.  <b>Follow-up Research Suggestions:</b> Highlighting areas for future research could provide a roadmap for subsequent studies in the field.            In conclusion, the manuscript exhibits a generally appropriate structure and subsections that facilitate comprehension of the research on milk production and marketing, with minor adjustments suggested for even greater clarity and impact.</p>	
<p><b>Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</b></p>	<p>The manuscript presents a scientifically robust analysis of milk production and marketing in the Gazipur District of Uttar Pradesh, utilizing a descriptive and analytical research design. It employs a comprehensive methodology, including surveys of 150 cattle owners categorized into small, medium, and large-scale operations, ensuring a representative sample for data collection. The research rigorously examines various cost components involved in milk production, such as fodder, labor, and veterinary charges, providing detailed financial insights (e.g., the average cost of rearing a milch buffalo ranges from Rs. 138.41 to Rs. 180.8 per day). Furthermore, the study correlates demographic factors (age, gender, education) of cattle owners with milk marketing efficiency, indicating a thoughtful approach to understanding the socio-economic dynamics at play. The data collected through direct personal interviews, conducted biannually using a pre-tested schedule, adds credibility to the findings by enhancing the reliability of the information gathered. Overall, the manuscript is grounded in empirical data and presents a clear, systematic analysis of the current state of dairy farming in the region, making it a valuable contribution to agricultural economics.</p> <p><b>Technical Soundness</b></p> <p>The technical soundness of the manuscript is underpinned by its systematic approach to data collection and analysis. The use of established economic analysis methods allows for the accurate assessment of production and maintenance costs associated with milch buffaloes. Specifically, the research details various cost components, highlighting that fodder costs are the most significant expense across all household categories, which accounts for an average of Rs. 47.59 to Rs. 52.52. Additionally, the study addresses various challenges faced by farmers, such as market inefficiencies and high middlemen profits, which are critical for understanding the broader implications of dairy farming in Uttar Pradesh. By contextualizing these challenges within the framework of recent agricultural policies aimed at improving market conditions, the manuscript reflects an awareness of the changing dynamics in the dairy sector. This comprehensive analysis not only enhances the scientific robustness of the manuscript but also ensures its relevance to stakeholders in the agricultural and economic sectors.</p> <p>In summary, the manuscript is scientifically sound and technically robust due to its rigorous methodology, detailed cost analysis, and relevant socio-economic context, making it a significant addition to the field of dairy economics.</p>	
<p><b>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.</b>            =</p>	<p>The references listed in the documents include several studies and articles related to dairy economics and milk production. However, most of these references date back to the 1990s and early 2000s, which raises questions about their relevance to current practices and trends in the dairy industry. Here are some notable references:</p> <p>Grover, D.K. and Mehta, S.K. (1995). "An Economic profile of dairying in rural Punjab (A case study)." Indian J. of Agril. Economics, 50 (3): 354-355.</p> <p>Hymajyothi, S. et al. (2003). "Economics of Buffalo milk production." Indian J. Dairy Science, 56 (4): 258-260.</p> <p>Singh, R.B. et al. (1999). "Market led production planning of milk producers in district Kanpur." Indian J. of Agril. Marketing, 13(2):43.</p> <p>Mahajan, S. (2010). "Economic analysis of rural and periurban dairy farms in Ludhiana district of</p>	

**Review Form 3**

	<p>Punjab."</p> <p>Kumar, Y. &amp; Shukla, S.K. (2017). "Milk production function and resource use efficiency in rural and urban area of district Bulandshahr of Western U.P."</p> <p>Sri, C.R. &amp; Suhasini, K. (2020). "Effect of Holistic Adoption of Dairy Farming Technologies on Households Farm Income of Small and Marginal Farmers: A Study of Telangana." Asian Journal of Agricultural Extension, Economics and Sociology, 114-122.</p> <p>Suggestions for Additional References</p> <p>To strengthen the current research, it would be beneficial to include more recent studies from the last five years that reflect current market dynamics, technological advancements, and changes in agricultural policies. Suggested areas for additional references include:</p> <p>Recent economic analyses of dairy farming post-COVID-19.</p> <p>Studies on the impact of current agricultural policies on dairy production.</p> <p>Articles focusing on innovations in dairy technology and production efficiency.</p> <p>Research on consumer trends in dairy consumption and preferences.</p> <p>Comparative studies of dairy farming in different regions or countries conducted in the past five years.</p> <p>Reports from governmental or agricultural organizations regarding dairy market trends.</p> <p>Case studies examining the effects of climate change on dairy farming</p>	
<p><u>Minor</u> REVISION comments</p> <p><b>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</b></p>	<p>The language and English quality of the article appears to be suitable for scholarly communications based on several observations:</p> <p><b>Clarity and Precision:</b> The text uses clear and precise language, effectively conveying complex concepts related to dairy production and marketing dynamics.</p> <p><b>Descriptive and Analytical Approach:</b> The article employs a descriptive and analytical design, indicative of a scholarly style that emphasizes thorough research and methodology.</p> <p><b>Technical Terminology:</b> The use of specific terminology relevant to dairy farming, economics, and marketing enhances the academic tone, demonstrating familiarity with the field.</p> <p><b>Structured Presentation:</b> Information is presented in a well-organized manner, with sections detailing methodology, results, and discussions, which is typical for academic writing.</p> <p><b>Use of Data and Statistics:</b> The inclusion of numerical data, such as costs associated with milk production (e.g., Rs. 50519.65 for desi buffaloes and Rs. 56857.32 for murrh buffaloes) adds credibility and a quantitative basis for the findings 1.</p> <p><b>Citations and References:</b> The article includes citations to previous studies and relevant literature, which is essential for scholarly work to support claims and provide context 7.</p> <p><b>Formal Tone:</b> The language maintains a formal tone throughout, which is appropriate for academic discourse.</p> <p><b>Detailed Methodology:</b> The methodology section describes the sampling process, data collection techniques, and demographic assessments in detail, aligning with scholarly standards for research transparency 3.</p> <p>Additional Considerations</p> <p>While the language quality is largely suitable, a few areas could be enhanced:</p> <p><b>Complex Sentences:</b> Some sentences are lengthy and may benefit from simplification for improved readability.</p> <p><b>Grammar and Syntax:</b> Minor grammatical errors could exist, which should be reviewed to ensure professionalism.</p> <p>Conclusion</p> <p>In summary, the language quality of the article is generally appropriate for scholarly communications, characterized by clarity, structured organization, and formal tone, with the necessity of minor refinements to grammar and sentence structure for optimal readability.</p>	
<p><u>Optional/General</u> comments</p>		

**Review Form 3**

**PART 2:**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b>	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

**Reviewer Details:**

Name:	<b>Tanane Omar</b>
Department, University & Country	<b>Hassan II University of Casablanca, Morocco</b>