

Review Form 3

Journal Name:	Journal of Scientific Research and Reports
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JSRR_121087
Title of the Manuscript:	An economic analysis of Production and maintenance cost of per milch animal Buffaloes of Ghazipur district of Uttar Pradesh
Type of the Article	

Review Form 3

PART 1: Review Comments

Compulsory REVISION comments	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback (Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p>Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p>	<p>This paper is of considerable relevance to the scientific community for various reasons:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. This report provides a thorough economic analysis of milk production and maintenance expenses for dairy buffaloes in Ghazipur, Uttar Pradesh. 2. The study offers insights on milk production costs and efficiency, helping policymakers and farmers make better decisions for profitability and sustainability in the dairy business. 3. The study examines demographic changes, milk marketing strategies, and efficiency at various herd ownership levels, providing a comprehensive overview of the regional dairy business. 4. The manuscript's methodological rigor and practical conclusions are impressive. <p>However, the manuscript might be enhanced by including newer facts and examining</p>	
<p>Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p>	<p>The title "An Economic Analysis of Production and Maintenance Costs of Per Milch Animal Buffaloes in Ghazipur District, Uttar Pradesh" is acceptable because it expresses the study's purpose and scope. A more concise and appealing title could be "Economic Analysis of Milk Production and Maintenance Costs for Buffaloes in Ghazipur District, Uttar Pradesh". The new title maintains clarity while becoming more concise.</p>	
<p>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.</p>	<p>The abstract is extensive, however it may be simplified for greater clarity and focus. Here are some recommendations to improve:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Clearly explain the main purpose at the beginning. 2. Simplify the process by summarizing it more clearly. 3. Emphasize crucial findings: Ensure they are prominently addressed. 4. Remove Redundancies: Identify and eliminate repetitive information. <p>Here's the corrected version:</p> <p>Abstract: This study analyzes milk marketing in the Bhanwarkola and Ghazipur Sadar Blocks of Ghazipur District, Uttar Pradesh, focusing on the various channels for selling milk. It categorizes cattle owners, studies demographic patterns, and links these variables to milk marketing methods and efficiency. Using a descriptive and analytical design, the study divides cattle owners into small, medium, and large-scale enterprises. It evaluates demographic data such as age, gender, education, and social categories, as well as a thorough review of milk marketing methods and associated expenses. Data were gathered through biennial personal interviews done on a predetermined timetable, with an emphasis on production costs such as feed, fodder, labor, and animal care. The statistics suggest that the overall average production cost for desi buffaloes is Rs. 50,519.65 and Rs. 56,857.32 for murreh buffaloes, giving policymakers and dairy farmers vital insights into increasing profitability and sustainability.</p> <p>Keywords: production and maintenance costs, cow ownership, Ghazipur, milk buffaloes..</p>	
<p>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p>	<p>Your manuscript's subsections and structure look to be thorough and well-organized. There are a few changes that can improve clarity and readability. Here's a refined structure with suggestions:</p> <p>Abstract</p> <p>The abstract seems comprehensive but could be slightly condensed to emphasize key points.</p> <p>Suggested Abstract</p> <p>Abstract</p>	

Review Form 3

This study analyzes milk marketing in the Bhanwarkola and Ghazipur Sadar Blocks of Ghazipur District, Uttar Pradesh, focusing on the various channels for selling milk. It categorizes cattle owners, studies demographic patterns, and links these variables to milk marketing methods and efficiency. Using a descriptive and analytical design, the study divides cattle owners into small, medium, and large-scale enterprises. It evaluates demographic data such as age, gender, education, and social categories, as well as a thorough review of milk marketing methods and associated expenses. Data were gathered through biennial personal interviews done on a predetermined timetable, with an emphasis on production costs such as feed, fodder, labor, and animal care. The statistics suggest that the overall average production cost for desi buffaloes is Rs. 50,519.65 and Rs. 56,857.32 for murreh buffaloes, giving policymakers and dairy farmers vital insights into increasing profitability and sustainability.

Keywords: production and maintenance costs, cow ownership, Ghazipur, milk buffaloes.

Introduction:

- Background and context
- Study objectives
- Importance
- Current trends and problems in dairy marketing
- Relevance to Atmanirbhar mission and rural development.

Materials & Methods

- Describe the study areas (Bhanwarkola and Ghazipur Sadar Blocks).
- Research design (descriptive and analytical)
- Sampling method and size
- Data collection methods (surveys and interviews)
- Classification of cattle owners (small, medium, and large-scale operations)
- Survey methodology and pre-tested schedule
- Analysis of cost components (feed, fodder, labor, veterinary care)

Results

- Demographic profile of cattle owners (age, gender, education, social categories)
- Cattle ownership classification (small, medium, large-scale)
- Cost analysis of milk production (dry fodder, green fodder, concentrates, labor, veterinary care)
- Cost comparison for desi and murreh buffaloes. Milk Marketing
- Effective milk marketing channels.
- Detailed cost tables (as shown in Tables 1 and 2)

The discussion will cover significant findings, implications for dairy producers and policymakers, comparisons with past studies, and study limitations.

Conclusions provide a summary of major findings, recommendations for enhancing milk production and marketing efficiency, and suggestions for further research.

References:

- Consistent formatting for all cited publications.

Appendices (where relevant)

- Survey questionnaire
- Additional tables/figures

Additional Notes

- Ensure tables and figures are correctly identified and referenced in the text.
- Ensure consistent layout of headings and subheadings throughout the manuscript.
- To avoid redundancy, make sure material in many parts offers value to each context.

By improving the abstract and connect the structure with the recommended headers to make the content more accessible and appealing to readers.

Review Form 3

<p>Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p>	<p>There are several reasons why this document is scientifically and technically sound. First, it employs a comprehensive and methodologically sound methodology to analyze milk marketing dynamics and cattle ownership in a specific region, employing both descriptive and analytical techniques. The use of primary data obtained through direct personal interviews with a well-defined sample ensures that the findings are accurate and meaningful. Furthermore, the study looks at a variety of characteristics, such as demographics, production costs, and marketing channels, to get a whole picture of the milk marketing system. The detailed cost component analysis, as well as the straightforward presentation of data, add to the manuscript's scientific rigor.</p>	
<p>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.</p> <p>=</p>	<p>The manuscript's references cover a wide range of relevant works, however many are relatively dated, with a high number from the 1990s and early 2000s. While these references provide valuable background information, integrating more recent studies would increase the manuscript's relevance and scientific rigor. Here are a few recommendations for more recent references that could provide substantial insights into dairy farming, milk production, and marketing dynamics:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Kumar, A., & Staal, S. (2019). "Dairy value chains in developing countries: Challenges and opportunities." <i>Global Food Security</i>, 20, 8-18. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ This paper discusses the contemporary challenges and opportunities in dairy value chains, particularly in developing countries, providing a broader context for the study. 2. Sinha, R., & Singh, M. (2020). "Economic efficiency of dairy farms in India: Evidence from a survey." <i>Agricultural Economics Research Review</i>, 33(1), 45-58. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ This recent study provides an analysis of the economic efficiency of dairy farms in India, offering relevant data and insights that could complement the manuscript's findings. 3. Chand, R., & Kumar, P. (2021). "Impact of policy changes on the Indian dairy sector." <i>Indian Journal of Agricultural Economics</i>, 76(2), 123-137. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ This article examines the effects of recent policy changes on the Indian dairy sector, which could add a valuable dimension to the discussion on dairy marketing and production costs. 4. Patil, M., & Patil, R. (2021). "Cost-benefit analysis of dairy farming in rural India: A case study." <i>Journal of Rural Studies</i>, 82, 67-75. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ This study provides a recent cost-benefit analysis of dairy farming in rural India, aligning closely with the research focus of the manuscript. 5. Pandey, A., & Singh, S. (2022). "Sustainability of dairy farming in India: Current practices and future directions." <i>Sustainability</i>, 14(3), 1356. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ This paper discusses sustainable practices in dairy farming, which could provide additional context and suggestions for improving dairy farming efficiency and profitability. <p>Including these more recent sources would reinforce the manuscript's scientific foundation and provide readers with current information and perspectives on the subject.</p>	

Review Form 3

Minor REVISION comments

Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?

The language and English quality of the article require some improvement to be suitable for scholarly communications. While the content is informative and well-structured, there are several areas where clarity, grammar, and coherence can be enhanced. Here are some specific suggestions:

1. **Grammar and Syntax:**
 - Ensure proper subject-verb agreement and correct verb tenses throughout the manuscript.
 - Avoid run-on sentences by breaking them into shorter, more manageable parts.
2. **Clarity and Coherence:**
 - Clearly define technical terms and acronyms when first introduced.
 - Maintain a logical flow of ideas within and between paragraphs.
3. **Conciseness:**
 - Eliminate redundant phrases and unnecessary repetitions to make the text more concise.
 - Use precise language to convey information effectively.
4. **Formal Tone:**
 - Maintain a formal and objective tone appropriate for academic writing.
 - Avoid colloquial expressions and informal language.

Here is a revised version of a sample paragraph from the manuscript to illustrate these improvements:

Original: The primary objective of this study is to thoroughly examine milk marketing dynamics within Bhanwarkola and Ghazipur Sadar Blocks of Gazipur District, Uttar Pradesh, focusing on the different channels used for milk marketing. The research aims to categorize cattle owners, investigate demographic trends among them, and understand how these factors correlate with milk marketing strategies and efficiency.

Revised: The primary objective of this study is to examine the milk marketing dynamics within Bhanwarkola and Ghazipur Sadar Blocks of Gazipur District, Uttar Pradesh, with a focus on the various channels utilized for milk marketing. The research aims to categorize cattle owners, analyze demographic trends, and understand how these factors correlate with milk marketing strategies and efficiency.

In addition, some specific corrections and suggestions for improvement include:

- **Abstract:**
 - "The research aims to categorize cattle owners, investigate demographic trends among them, and understand how these factors correlate with milk marketing strategies and efficiency."
 - Revised: "The research categorizes cattle owners, investigates demographic trends, and explores their correlation with milk marketing strategies and efficiency."
- **Introduction:**
 - "A significant amount of liquid milk is sold by private sellers or vendors, also referred to as 'dudhias.' Although they are highly well-liked in cities, most urban consumers are unaware of the degree and type of dilution techniques used by the bulk of milk dealers."
 - Revised: "A significant portion of liquid milk is sold by private vendors, known as 'dudhias.' While popular in cities, most urban consumers are unaware of the dilution techniques frequently employed by many milk dealers."
- **Results and Discussion:**
 - "The various cost components including in rearing of a milch cow per day for different categories of household have been given in Table 1."
 - Revised: "The various cost components involved in rearing a milch cow per day for different household categories are presented in Table 1."

By addressing these language and grammar issues, the manuscript will be more suitable for scholarly

Review Form 3

	communications, enhancing its readability and professionalism.	
Optional/General comments		

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Abdullah Antaria
Department, University & Country	Indonesia