

Review Form 3

Journal Name:	Journal of Experimental Agriculture International
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JEAI_123010
Title of the Manuscript:	Exploring Blast Pathogen and Causal Organism: The Significance of R Genes in Marker-Assisted Selection
Type of the Article	REVIEW ARTICLE

Review Form 3

PART 1: Review Comments

Compulsory REVISION comments	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	The incidence of rice blast disease is increasing with the changing climatic scenario. It is important to understand the interaction of the phytopathogen with rice plants to formulate a competent strategy for negating its adverse effects. A clear understanding of the R-genes is also very essential for successful breeding programmes. However, in the present state, the manuscript fails to provide in-depth knowledge about the same.	
Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)	There is a need to change the title of the manuscript. The authors are focused on describing the pathogen and the R-genes, therefore the title must be in coercion with the manuscript. A suggested title is named below: "An insight into the aetiology of <i>Magnaporthe oryzae</i> and the R genes in rice/paddy for the inception of efficient breeding programmes"	
Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.	The abstract is insufficient in synopsising the manuscript. There is a lack of description about the pathogen and the R genes in the abstract.	
Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?	The subsection's headings need to be changed owing to the grammatical and scientific correctness. However, the structure of the manuscript is alright.	
Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	In the present state, the manuscript lacks robustness. There is no detailed description of the pathogen and the symptoms of the disease. The figure is of low quality and is not self-explanatory. The origin and identifications of R genes are also superficial and just a combination of a few articles. Some of the technical terms are also incorrect. The gene pyramiding and MAS portion of the manuscript is very less and needs to be bulked up to strengthen the manuscript.	
Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form. :	The references used are very old and only 3-4 references are in 2020s. There have been numerous studies conducted on rice blast and its R genes in recent decades which should be incorporated in the manuscript. The origin and discovery portion can be explained with the original references but the rest of the subsections should at least contain 5-10 recent references.	
Minor REVISION comments Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?	The quality of the language is not up to the mark. There are many grammatical errors in the manuscript and an irregular use of American and British English. Please stick to either of the one for a more coherent style of writing.	
Optional/General comments	The manuscript requires major revisions.	

Review Form 3

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Md. Mahtab Rashid
Department, University & Country	Bihar Agricultural University, India