

Review Form 3

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Soil Science and Plant Nutrition
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJSSPN_121142
Title of the Manuscript:	Effect of cumulative amendment of soil with fly ash in combination with other nutrients on change in grain yield, crude protein, NPN and true protein contents of rice
Type of the Article	Research article

Review Form 3

PART 1: Review Comments

Compulsory REVISION comments	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback (Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	It seems through this research that fly ash (FA) which is an obnoxious solid waste material produced from thermal power plants can be used in agriculture at large scale as it contains many essential nutrients for plant growth which is helpful for the improvement of soil quality and consequently plant growth and grain quality from sustainability point of view without having side effect.	
Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)	Yes	
Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.	Yes	
Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?	Yes, but needs to add treatment details and results in Tabular form also along with Fig. Similarly, sub title should be modified as per suggestion.	
Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	Appropriate methodology has been utilized for carrying research work. The experiments site selection, fertilizer application, all necessary agronomic practices were followed as per the recommended practices for the Rice crops. The data collected were analyzed statistically for ascertaining precise impact of the Fertilizer treatments on the yield and crude protein, NPN and true protein contents of rice crops. Planning and conduct of experiments are appropriate and according to the statistical methods. The conclusion draws by the author is valid and have practical utility from future recommendation point of view which will help to bridge the technology gap. Similarly, if possible mention Future line of Work in one or two sentence.	
Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.	Yes, references are sufficient and recent but needs to arrange in chronologically	
Minor REVISION comments Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?	Yes	
Optional/General comments	Manuscript (No. Ms_AJSSPN_121142) entitled " Effect of cumulative amendment of soil with fly ash in combination with other nutrients on change in grain yield, crude protein, NPN and true protein contents of rice submitted for publication in Asian Journal of Soil Science and Plant Nutrition is scientifically narrated considering présent needs and hence, I recommend that the manuscript is accepted for publication with due corrections which is marked.	

Review Form 3

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Manoj Sudhakar Talathi
Department, University & Country	Dr. Balasaheb SAWANT Konkan Krishi Vidyapeeth, India