

Review Form 3

Journal Name:	South Asian Research Journal of Natural Products
Manuscript Number:	Ms_SARJNP_124880
Title of the Manuscript:	Comparative HPLC, Elemental, and Antioxidant Assay of Ipomoea aquatica and Telfairia occidentalis.
Type of the Article	

Review Form 3

PART 1: Review Comments

Compulsory REVISION comments	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback (Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p>Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p>	<p>The manuscript is important as it highlights the nutritive value of ignored, underutilized crops in FAO terms. Various crops grown in marginal lands/ wild vegetables have rich mineral and phytochemical contents. This study highlights 2 such plants- Kangkong (<i>Ipomea aquatica</i>) of south east Asia & Fluted Pumpkin (<i>Telferia occidentalis</i>) of Africa. These can be future "supefoods" so require research & publicity.</p>	
<p>Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p>	<p>Yes but better to substitute "Comparative HPLC, Elemental" with "Phytochemical and" and their common names Kangkong & Fluted Pumpkin in the Title.</p>	
<p>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.</p>	<p>Yes but please add in the abstract end if you think your study herbs are more 70% potent antioxidants than vitamin C.</p>	
<p>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p>	<p>They are OK.</p>	
<p>Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p>	<p>The article is scientifically sound but its crude so some polishing is needed for fine presentation as suggested. Antioxidant power is crucial test to judge pharmaceutical power of herbs so it important the authors studied it. Authors assume the reader knows everything & left gaps such as not mentioning country or graph interpretation.</p>	
<p>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.</p>	<p>References are adequate but 2 contexts (AMR, farming) may be added for which adding 1 reference is suggested- https://www.qeios.com/read/3G4GP7.3- Ghate U & Kulkarni H, Antimicrobial Ayurveda Crops as Superfoods for Export, Conservation & Farmers' Benefit. Qeios, 2024.</p>	

Review Form 3

<p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>	<p>Yes. English is fine.</p>	
<p>Optional/General comments</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Please mention that if the 2 plants are part of regular or only seasonal diet or used only as herbs in local traditions and for what purpose. It is unclear if these are eaten commonly. Kangkong (Ipomoea aquatica) leaves are regularly cooked & consumed by tribes in India to reduce the risk of fever, weakness (anemia?) etc. (ref. https://www.qeios.com/read/3G4GP7.3) 2) Please show data in all 4 tables only upto 1 decimal. Showing more decimals does not make it more scientific but it confuses the reader. If the basic numbers range is large say 0 to 45, a difference of 0.25 is 5% & numbers below it is insignificant say 0.02 or 0.01 etc. 3) Table 1, row 1- Please add 's' after 's' in the word "Potasium". 4) Table 2 row 1- please add "r" after "t" in the word- "Resveratol" 5) Please compare your results with their more famous peers like Potato (<i>Ipomoea batata</i>), for clarity. 6) Please add that fluted pumpkin is used to make the famous cuisine "ogili" (ref. Badifu, Gabriel I.O. "Food Potentials of Some Unconventional Oilseeds Grown in Nigeria - a Brief Review." Plant Foods for Human Nutrition 43.3 (1993): 211-24), at the end of the 1st sentence in section 1- Introduction after the word "cuisine" (by prefixing such as"). 7) Please also add use of Fluted Pumpkin in treating anemia (ref. no. 2- Aworunse et al) 8) Please add that since Fluted Pumpkin contains notable Quinine levels, its use in treating malaria traditionally seems justified. 9) Please present the data for the fig. 3 in small table form also including Vitamin C- ascorbic acid. 10) Add 1 line of interpretation of fig. 2- what does comparison with Ascorbic acid show? If <i>I. aquatica</i> is better & preferable than <i>T. occidentalis</i>, aren't the 2 better than vitamin C? Please add that to the conclusion. Is IC₅₀ of 200 about 70% better to 600 (vitamin C)? 11) TPC- total phenolic content of either herb is not mentioned but directly you jumped to radical scavenging activity/ antioxidant power measurement using DPPH method. 12) Add DPPH term in the methodology, its used directly in conclusion! 13) Please indicate if their farming can be profitable and promoted (ref. <i>ibid.</i>). 14) Antimicrobial resistance is an emerging global health risk and if these 2 can help to address it? 15) Please add the country after the region names in paragraph 2 of section 1- introduction- "Bayelsa State" & "Ogbia" as other national may not know your country! 	

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</p>	<p><u>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</u></p>	

Reviewer Details:

<p>Name:</p>	<p>Utkarsh Ghate</p>
<p>Department, University & Country</p>	<p>India</p>