

### ReviewForm3

|                         |   |
|-------------------------|---|
| Journal Name:           | <a href="#">SouthAsianJournalofSocialStudiesandEconomics</a>                  |
| ManuscriptNumber:       | Ms_SAJ SSE_124885   |
| Title ofthe Manuscript: | The Financial PathTo Urban Development: Municipal Revenues And Capital Outlay |
| Type ofthe Article      | Research Paper  |

#### **PART1:Review Comments**

| <b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments   | Reviewer's comment  | Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i> |
|---|---|---|
| Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.                        | The manuscript provides significant insights into the role of municipal revenue streams in shaping capital outlays, which is a critical aspect of sustainable urban development in the country. The findings of the study are contemporary and relevant in the urban finance domain. The methodology used is robust and justified. The manuscript is appreciated for its methodological rigor and interesting findings.   |   |
| Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)  | The title could be improved. Here are a few suggestions for the title;<br>1) A Study of Revenue Streams and Capital Outlay for Municipal Corporations in India<br>2) Revenue Streams and Capital Outlay: An Empirical Study of Municipal Corporations in India<br>3) Revenue and Expenditure Patterns: Evidence from Select Cities in India   |   |
| Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.   | The abstract is comprehensive, so no addition or deletion is suggested. It can just be improved in terms of English language and in the background of academic writing.   |   |
| Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?<br>-   | Yes, subsections and structure of the manuscript is appropriate.  |   |
| Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part. | The manuscript appears to be robust and technically sound. The use of empirical data from 26 Indian States and Union Territories ensures that the analysis is grounded and relevance, enhancing its applicability. The usage of an Ordinary Least Squares (OLS) model for estimating the relationship between different revenue streams and capital outlay demonstrates the appropriate use of statistical techniques.  |   |
| Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.<br>-  | No, the references are not sufficient and should be improved. Please add numbers like how much is the present urbanisation and what it is expected to be globally and for India from UNDP reports and World Cities Report. Reference to global literature is completely missing in the article. Papers and articles from urban finance experts like Abhay Pethe, O.P Mathur and R. Bhagat can be added to enhance the review of literature and the introduction section. Further, reference to papers/articles from where the methodology is adopted can be provided. |   |
| <b>Minor</b> REVISION comments<br><br>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?   | The English language should be improved. For example, the Introduction section directly starts with "this paper attempts to answer..." without giving any background of the topic. Definition of what is an urban area (ULB) in India should be provided for international audience.  |   |
| <b>Optional/General</b> comments  | <b>SEE ATTACHMENT</b>   |   |

**ReviewForm3**

**PART 2:**

|   | <b>Reviewer's comment</b>  | <b>Author's comment</b> <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i> |
|---|--|---|
| <b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b> | <i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i> |   |

**Reviewer Details:**

|                                  |   |
|----------------------------------|---|
| Name:                            | <b>Gargi Patil</b>  |
| Department, University & Country | <b>Symbiosis International (Deemed University), India</b> |