

ReviewForm 3

JournalName:	AsianJournalofCaseReportsin Surgery
ManuscriptNumber:	Ms_AJCRS_124661
TitleoftheManuscript:	Achallengingprimarysplenicystadherenttotheleft kidney
TypeoftheArticle	Casereport

PART1:ReviewComments

Compulsory REVISIONcomments	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback (Pleasecorrectthemanuscriptandhighlightthatpart in themanuscript. It ismandatorythatauthors shouldwritehis/herfeedback here)
Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	Primary hydatid cyst are generally found in liver. The standard treatment of hydatid cyst is removal of cyst. This is an interesting case study of splenic hydatid cyst in spleen that is adherent and fistulized to left kidney where total splenectomy was done.	
Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)	Yes it is suitable	
Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.	Yes, it is comprehensive	
Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?	Yes, the structure of the manuscript is appropriate. No method section is incorporated because of kind of manuscript	
Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	Aim of the study highlights the case of splenic hydatid cyst which is fistulized and adherent to left kidney which is generally a rare condition. Standard treatment procedures are performed which is well summarized. Photographs of sonogram and CT scan is placed with surgically removed specimen. Detail of microscopic examination with photograph scan be a value addition to the manuscript.	
Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.	Same reference cited twice as highlighted. Can be cited once for uniformity in the manuscript as per journal norms. Only one reference of 2024 is cited. Better to add more recent articles which are available for the same topic.	
Minor REVISIONcomments		
Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?	Yes, it is ok	

ReviewForm 3

Optional/General comments

Addition of photographs microscopic examination and histology can be made

ReviewForm 3
PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Mayank Rajawat
Department, University & Country	India