

Review Form 3

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Research
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJFAR_122951
Title of the Manuscript:	Population dynamics of Nile tilapia (<i>Oreochromis niloticus</i>, L.1758) from Khashm El-Girba Reservoir, Atbara River, Eastern Sudan.
Type of the Article	Research Article

Review Form 3

PART 1: Review Comments

Compulsory REVISION comments	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback (Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	Population dynamics of aquatic organism is a very important phenomenon. Presently study remarkably highlights these things. We have appreciated the efforts of the authors.	
Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)	Use full surname of scientist in the title: Population dynamics of Nile tilapia (<i>Oreochromis niloticus</i> , Linnaeus.1758) from Khashm El-Girba Reservoir, Atbara River, Eastern Sudan. It will be more scientific.	
Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.	The present study clearly and objectively presents the main and relevant points of the research. In method section a clear and scientific justification is required for choosing the specific length of the fishes.	
Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?	Yes	
Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	The interpretation is appropriate and aligns with the research expectations. But vBGF is very old model. There are more advanced models such as Generalized additive model, Individual Based Models and methods developed to address the limitations of vBGF, especially in cases where growth is influenced by various environmental factors or where organisms exhibit complex growth patterns. Authors will be highly appreciated to use these new generation models of population dynamics.	
Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.	Authors' should have to incorporate some current references including the year 2024.	
Minor REVISION comments Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?	Yes.	
Optional/General comments	The discussion effectively develops the results of this research. However, I strongly recommend that you also include a discussion on the relevance of your results for the advancement of science. It is important to highlight the ecological significance of your findings.	

Review Form 3

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Surajit Majumder
Department, University & Country	Bankura Sammilani College, Bankura University, India