

Review Form 3

Journal Name:	Asian Soil Research Journal
Manuscript Number:	Ms_ASRJ_123004
Title of the Manuscript:	Potential Impacts of Green Manure Incorporation on Soil Fertility Enhancement and Rice yield (Review)
Type of the Article	Review

General guidelines for the Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guidelines for the Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

<https://r1.reviewerhub.org/general-editorial-policy/>

Important Policies Regarding Peer Review

Peer review Comments Approval Policy: <https://r1.reviewerhub.org/peer-review-comments-approval-policy/>

Benefits for Reviewers: <https://r1.reviewerhub.org/benefits-for-reviewers>

Review Form 3

PART 1: Review Comments

Compulsory REVISION comments	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback (Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	This research contributes to the scientific community by providing a comprehensive analysis of the role of green manuring as an alternative nutrient source to reduce the reliance on chemical fertilizers in rice production.	
Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)	<p>According to the discussions in the body section. I would rather suggest the following title</p> <p><i>Synergist effect of Green Manure and inorganic fertilizer on Rice Production and Soil Fertility: A Review</i></p>	
Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.	The abstract is comprehensive. However methodology part is missing and the aim should be shortened and improved to clear identify problem and gap to fill	
Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?	Yes	
Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	<p>This manuscript appears to be scientifically robust and technically sound for the following reasons :</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The manuscript reviews a wide range of studies which provides a broad overview of the current knowledge on the impacts of green manure on rice yield and soil fertility 2. The review covers different types of green manure plants which ensures a thorough understanding of green manure's effects on soil and crops 3. The manuscript provides specific quantitative data from multiple studies, which enhances the scientific rigor by allowing readers to understand the extent of the effects being discussed. 4. The manuscript provides evidence of the sustained benefits of green manuring and offering alternative nutrient management strategies that could reduce the reliance on chemical fertilizers. This relevance to real-world applications makes the manuscript scientifically valuable. 	
Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form. :	<p>No, additional recent references would strengthen the paper</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Naz et al., 2023. Impact of Green Manuring on Health of Low Fertility Calcareous Soils. <i>Land</i> 2023, 12(3), 546; https://doi.org/10.3390/land12030546 2. Zhong, J., Li, Z., Tang, H. <i>et al.</i> The application of varying amount of green manure combined with nitrogen fertilizer altered the soil bacterial community and rice yield in karst paddy areas. <i>BMC Plant Biol</i> 24, 646 (2024). https://doi.org/10.1186/s12870-024-05351-7 3. Md. Moshiul Islam et al., 2019. Green manuring effects on crop morpho-physiological characters, rice yield and soil properties. <i>Physiol Mol Biol Plants</i>. 2019 Jan; 25(1): 303–312. doi: 10.1007/s12298-018-0624-2 4. Adekiya AO, Agbede TM, Aboyeji CM, Dunsin O, Ugbe JO. Green manures and NPK fertilizer effects on soil properties, growth, yield, mineral and vitamin C composition of okra (<i>Abelmoschus esculentus</i> (L.) Moench) <i>J Saudi Soc Agril Sci</i>. 2017 [Google Scholar] 5. Li Z, Zhang X, Xu J, Cao K, Wang J, Xu C, Cao W. Green manure incorporation with reductions in chemical fertilizer inputs improves rice yield and soil organic matter accumulation. <i>J Soil Sediment</i>. 2020;20:2784–93. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11368-020-02622-2. 	

Review Form 3

Minor REVISION comments		
Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?	Yes	
<u>Optional/General</u> comments		

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Solange Uwingabire
Department, University & Country	Sokoine University of Agriculture, Rwanda