

Review Form 3

Journal Name:	Journal of Experimental Agriculture International
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JEAI_124734
Title of the Manuscript:	Identification of purple blotch and thrips resistant lines of onion (<i>Allium cepa</i> L.)
Type of the Article	

Review Form 3

PART 1: Review Comments

Compulsory REVISION comments	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback (Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p>Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p>	<p>Onion yield is severely affected by Purple blotch disease. Purple blotch is a fungal disease caused by <i>Alternaria porri</i> (Ellis). Transmission of the disease is enhanced by thrips spp. The manuscript is of great importance since it deals with the different aspects of the purple blotch disease of onion and its management, especially through genetic approaches.</p>	
<p>Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p>	<p>Suitable</p>	
<p>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.</p>	<p>The last sentence of the abstract is to be omitted from here. It may be written in the recommendation section. Only the findings of the investigation should be mentioned here in concise format.</p>	
<p>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p>	<p>Yes, appropriate.</p>	
<p>Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p>	<p>The methodology used in the investigation is more or less standard, but the discussions are too short. Elaborate discussion is required. The results are not concise.</p>	
<p>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form. :</p>	<p>References are not sufficient. There are serious anomalies in the references. Some references to the manuscript are missing (highlighted by red ink) in the reference section and some references are listed in the reference section (highlighted by red ink) that are not found in the body of the manuscript. More updated references are needed to increase the quality of the paper. The following reference may be consulted-</p> <p>1. Dar, A. A., Sharma, S., Mahajan, R., Mushtaq, M., Salathia, A., Ahamad, S., & Sharma, J. P. (2020). Overview of purple blotch disease and understanding its management through chemical, biological and genetic approaches. <i>Journal of Integrative Agriculture</i>, 19(12), 3013-3024.</p>	

Review Form 3

Minor REVISION comments Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?	Suitable but not highly standard. There are a few grammatical errors which have been marked in red ink throughout the entire manuscript.	
Optional/General comments	The manuscript entitled ' Identification of purple blotch and thrips resistant lines of onion (<i>Alliumcepa</i> L.) ' is a nice piece of scientific work. All segments of the paper are beautifully presented by the author except for a few errors. A recommendation section and acknowledgement may be included before the references. However, the manuscript may be considered for publication after necessary changes as per the direction of the reviewer.	

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	S. M. Ali Ashraf
Department, University & Country	Khulna Government Womens' College, Bangladesh