

**Review Form 3**

Journal Name:	<b>International Journal of Plant &amp; Soil Science</b>
Manuscript Number:	<b>Ms_IJPSS_121252</b>
Title of the Manuscript:	<b>Effect of different altitudinal zones on growth parameters of Garcinia indica (Choisy) in Uttara Kannada</b>
Type of the Article	

**Review Form 3**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

<b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	From the title of the manuscript, I love any work that is based on indigenous plants and their usefulness. Works on their regeneration and conservation is always interesting. However, the design of the experiment and the sample size may not give use useful inside	
Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)	Yes	
Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.	NO, It does not bring out the problem the experiment was designed to solve and has nothing to say about the methods.	
Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?		
Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	<p>The manuscript is an attempt to study the the impact od altitude on the growth of the species. Dividing its range into 4 classes is scientifically sound. However, the following scientific deficiencies are clear in the manuscript</p> <p>Section titles are appropriate. But the contents are not.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ The introduction is scanty, made up of only the description of the species which is also full of repetitions.</li> <li>➤ It also lacks literature of the real time distribution and abundance of the species in the study area and beyond</li> <li>➤ We also do not know what his motivation to work on the species is. Maybe there are some problems with fruiting and maternal fitness etc</li> <li>➤ Apart from altitude what are the other biophysical conditions of the 4 sites? Altitude normally affects rainfall, temperature, sunshine hours, humidity cloudiness and so the species composition and form. The manuscript does not tell</li> <li>➤ How were study sites selected? How did the authors select the 5 plants to be measured, out of what population size of the species?</li> <li>➤ DBH of a species is not the only parameter that affects growth. Edaphic factor, physical conditions and biological too, especially the plants in association and the age of the plant, which for natural populations is again another topic of . We do not have any information on these.</li> <li>➤ Maybe these plants are in a plantation of the same age we also don't have any information on this.</li> </ul>	
Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.	The literature is very scanty for a species they term as important. It lacks reviews on aspects of ecology and reproduction of the species, its economic value and conservation status	

### Review Form 3

Minor REVISION comments <b>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</b>	Yes	
<u>Optional/General</u> comments		

### **PART 2:**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b>	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

### Reviewer Details:

Name:	<b>Neba Godlove Ambe</b>
Department, University & Country	<b>University of Buea, Cameroon</b>