

Review Form 3

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Soil Science and Plant Nutrition
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJSSPN_121769
Title of the Manuscript:	Soil Fertility Status of Paddy (Oryza Sativa L.) Growing Soils of Different Agro-Climatic Zones, Telangana, India
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guidelines for the Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guidelines for the Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

<https://r1.reviewerhub.org/general-editorial-policy/>

Important Policies Regarding Peer Review

Peer review Comments Approval Policy: <https://r1.reviewerhub.org/peer-review-comments-approval-policy/>

Benefits for Reviewers: <https://r1.reviewerhub.org/benefits-for-reviewers>

Review Form 3

PART 1: Review Comments

Compulsory REVISION comments	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	The manuscript is the need for the hour as the soil quality is degrading at faster rate due to traditional methods adopted by the farmers.	
Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)	It is suitable	
Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.	Line 9: Agriculture is not the main occupation; it is one of the main occupations Line 12-13: The sentence is not clear Line 17: the same abbreviations are to be followed in the whole manuscript The conclusion in the abstract is missing	
Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?	Yes	
Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	This manuscript will be scientifically robust , if the authors try the correlation analysis and the SQL.	
Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form. :	The authors have missed literatures which are worked on the same deccan plateau region, which are to be incorporated in literature review, which will be beneficial to compare their results from the same region. for example: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Vasu, Duraisamy, Pramod Tiwary, and Padikkal Chandran. "A novel and comprehensive soil quality index integrating soil morphological, physical, chemical, and biological properties." <i>Soil and Tillage Research</i> 244 (2024): 106246. • Vasu, Duraisamy, et al. "Pedogenic processes and soil–landform relationships for identification of yield-limiting soil properties." <i>Soil Research</i> 55.3 (2016): 273-284. • Tamburi, V., Shetty, A. & Shrihari, S. Characterization of spatial variability of vertisol micronutrients by geostatistical techniques in Deccan Plateau of India. <i>Model. Earth Syst. Environ.</i> 6, 173–182 (2020). 	

Review Form 3

<p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>	<p>The grammar is easily communicable to scientific community</p>	
<p>Optional/General comments</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• The statistical assessment is not up to the mark, the authors needs to do the correlation analysis, since the data collected is abundant.• The SQI (Soil quality index) needs to be incorporated.• The authors need to discuss about the paedogenic or parent material influence on soil quality• The sampling points has to be overlayed on the soil map , different colour or symbol to be assigned for NTZ,CTZ & STZ.• The area of the three zones must be mentioned -Line 65-66• Line 68: what are NBSS&LUP soil map?• The authors need to mention how the sample density was decided in each zone• Line 90: in which month the sampling were collected, and the duration also effects the soil nutrients availability• The pearson's correlation has to be done to know how the nutrients are influenced upon each other• Line 112: the representative images of soil sampling and laboratory analysis can be added.• Line 114-115: The importance of descriptive statistics needs to be mentioned• The authors haven't compared their results with other for discussion properly, they have only displayed the results in sentences. The authors needs to explain the reasons of low or high values in there samples compared to others• The individual parameter results have been mentioned, the inference of the results are missing• Line 153: The figures needs to be clear, the authors have mentioned Low nitrogen, high phosphorus, high potassium on what basis? This is where the SQI play an important role, to bifurcate high, medium & low along with correlation• Figures 2,3,4 are cyclic , except different zones, these figures can be merged into one figure with sub eg: 2a,2b&2c• Line 246: What is the meaning of paddy supporting all soils? It indicates other crops cannot be cultivated• Line 259: Figure 5 , Why only low nitrogen, high phosphorus & high potassium are mentioned ? the discussion is missing , in fact for all the figures.• Line 346: The conclusion and objectives should be in line. The application of these objectives are missing.	

Review Form 3

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Vinod N T
Department, University & Country	Reva University, India