

**Review Form 3**

Journal Name:	<b>Journal of Engineering Research and Reports</b>
Manuscript Number:	<b>Ms_JERR_123525</b>
Title of the Manuscript:	<b>Assessing the Sustainable Potential of Chemically Activated Crustacean Shells for Pilot- Scale Removal of Persistent Organic Pollutants in Contaminated Water: A Path Towards Environmental Sustainability</b>
Type of the Article	

## Review Form 3

### PART 1: Review Comments

<b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's Feedback</b> (Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<b>Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</b>	They developed a new adsorbent for organic dye removal	
<b>Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</b>	Yes, it is suitable.	
<b>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.</b>	Please rewrite the abstract, abstract must include the data values such as adsorption capacity of developed material, optimum pH, temperature should be mentioned in abstract.	
<b>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</b>	Yes, subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate.	
<b>Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</b>	Several characterization techniques were employed, and several experimental controlling factors were investigated and evaluated in this work. I recommend the manuscript for publication after considering the following suggestions which their addressing will fit the manuscript for publication.	
<b>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.</b> :	The authors should mention some examples of other natural adsorbents for pollutant removal to better support the statement "Adsorption processes represent one of the most effective means for purifying contaminated aqueous matrices", the following articles (and perhaps some others) should be referenced: Desalin. Water Treat. 272 (2022) 50-74; Mater. Adv. 3(14) (2022) 5645-5671; Appl. Sci. 2021, 11(18), 8377; J. Polym. Environ. 26 (2018) 3590-3602; Molecules 28(23) (2023) 7839; Int. J. Biol. Macromol. 253 (2023) 126884.	
<b>Minor</b> REVISION comments  <b>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</b>	The Manuscript needs thorough revision to improve the text quality and readability of work.	
<b>Optional/General</b> comments	The authors may refer to the adsorption of antibiotics using biosorbents in the introduction section, the authors may use: J. Hazard. Mater. 465 (2024) 133143. 4- The experimental conditions for the removal process must be listed with the captions of Figures and Tables. 5- Studying adsorption properties without determination of the equilibrium time and initial and final pH is impossible. Monitoring the change in pH during the adsorption is very important. 6- How many parallel experiments did you make? Are the results the only ones or means or what? 7- What is the water content of the adsorbent investigated in the adsorption study? The calculated adsorption capacity was calculated based on a dry or wet basis. 8- More profound discussions and comparisons with other published works are welcomed.	

### Review Form 3

#### **PART 2:**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b>	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

#### **Reviewer Details:**

Name:	<b>Khalid Z. Elwakeel</b>
Department, University & Country	<b>University of Jeddah, Saudi Arabia</b>