

Review Form 3

| | |
|--------------------------|--|
| Journal Name: | Asian Journal of Agricultural Extension, Economics & Sociology |
| Manuscript Number: | Ms_AJAEES_126056 |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Tackling Peri-Urban Food Insecurity Through Modern Agriculture |
| Type of the Article | Original Research Article |

General guidelines for the Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guidelines for the Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

<https://r1.reviewerhub.org/general-editorial-policy/>

Important Policies Regarding Peer Review

Peer review Comments Approval Policy: <https://r1.reviewerhub.org/peer-review-comments-approval-policy/>

Benefits for Reviewers: <https://r1.reviewerhub.org/benefits-for-reviewers>

PART 1: Review Comments

| Compulsory REVISION comments | Reviewer's comment | Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i> |
|--|--|---|
| Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part. | <p>This article suggests a valuable contribution to the field of urban agriculture and food security. Also, it addresses a critical issue faced by many developing countries which is the rapid growth of challenges in ensuring food security in urban areas. It provides valuable insights into the modern agriculture, specially hydroponics, to promote sustainable development.</p> <p>However, it could be delving deeper into sustainability of the implemented of this modern agriculture approach in the long-term. Also, exploring the potential economic impacts for both individual households and the broader community would provide a new understanding of their benefits.</p> | |
| Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title) | <p>Overall, the title is suitable. Some points can be considered:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The title is clear, However, it can be more specific about the type of modern agriculture used. For example, if it is hydroponics, incorporating the term in the title could make it more informative. - The title can also emphasize the potential impact of the approach. For example, using "Empowering" might highlight the potential benefits. <p>suggestions for title:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Hydroponic Solutions for Peri-Urban Food Insecurity - Cultivating a Sustainable Future: Modern Agriculture in Peri-Urban Food Security | |
| Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here. | <p>The abstract mentions challenges well. It could be suggested to add a sentences about the challenges faced by participants in implementing hydroponic projects and considering future directions of this project.</p> | |
| Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate? | <p>Overall, the article has a generally appropriate structure. But some subsections can be considered: In Methodology section, it can be divided in for example, research design, data collection methods, and data analysis techniques to be more specific. Also about PRA-pilot project, the author can provide more details.</p> | |
| Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part. | <p>The article is well-structured and scientifically address the research question, providing valuable insights and recommendations for the title.</p> | |

Review Form 3

| | | |
|---|--|--|
| <p>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.</p> | <p>Some of the references are older than a decade, it is better to use recent research to reflect the latest developments in this field. Also, some scientific papers related to "Analyzing successful Case studies of peri-urban agriculture projects" or "the economic impact of urban farming" can be considered.</p> | |
| <p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p> | <p>Overall, it is suitable for scholarly communication. But it is recommended to do Proofreading before any publishing.</p> | |
| <p>Optional/General comments</p> | <p>The article contributes well in this field and provide valuable insight. For improvement the author can consider "Future research directions" and "Discussion of limitations" as well.</p> | |

PART 2:

| | Reviewer's comment | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|--|---|--|
| <p>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</p> | <p><i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i></p> | |

Reviewer Details:

| | |
|----------------------------------|--|
| Name: | Rayeh Khatami |
| Department, University & Country | Islamic Azad University Mashhad Branch, Iran |