Review Form 3

Journal Name:	**Asian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Research**
Manuscript Number:	**Ms_AJFAR_125862**
Title of the Manuscript:	**Effects of Natural Carotenoid Enriched Feed on the Growth, Flesh Colour and Composition, and Palatability of a Silver Barb (Barbonymus gonionotus)**
Type of the Article	**Original Research Article**

Review Form 3

PART 1: Review Comments

Compulsory REVISION comments	**Reviewer's comment**	**Author's Feedback** *(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)*
Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	Carotenoids play a major role in commercial aquaculture. Various biological and nutritional role of carotenoids in aquatic animals are documented along with the effect of biotic and abiotic factors on carotenoids transport and retention and final flesh pigmentation. Pigmentation is one of the important quality attributes of the aquatic animal for consumer acceptability	
Is the title of the article suitable? **(If not please suggest an alternative title)**	**Title is suitable**	
Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.	**Abstract is not comprehensive, many information's are missed in abstract/ suggestions are add into the manuscript file**	
Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?	**Its depend upon journal policy**	
Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	**This study is suitable but, parameters and carotenoids are minimum. Improve the abstract, introduction and methodology, also update the results with correctly matching studies and describe the results precisely.**	
Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.	**References are not sufficient, update the references with latest citations**	
Minor REVISION comments **Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?**	Need to improve the write-up and language with grammar	
Optional/General comments	**The design of this study is not suitable, only 3 carotenoids with same dose level with limited factors.**	

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	**Author's comment** *(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)*
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	*(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)*	

Review Form 3

Reviewer Details:

Name:	**Muhammad Naveed**
Department, University & Country	**University of Agriculture, Pakistan**