

Review Form 3

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Research in Agriculture and Forestry
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJRAF_125120
Title of the Manuscript:	Estimation of Genetic Parameters in Bread Wheat (<i>Triticum Aestivum</i> L.) Genotypes Evaluated Under High Temperature Yield Trial in Ethiopia
Type of the Article	Research

Review Form 3

PART 1: Review Comments

Compulsory REVISION comments	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback (Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p>Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p>	<p>The topic of the manuscript is interesting and it has practical applications, plus the contribution to the scientific community; however, the study was conducted under "high temperature" which is not the case with maximum temperatures of 22.8 °C for Kulumsa and 28.6 for Melkasa. There is not information about the climatic (temperature) that prevailed during the time of the study. The writing has ample mistakes, and the edition has shortcomings. There are references lacking in the reference section, and references in that section that do not appear in the text of the manuscript. Also, in some references the years indicated do not match. Most references do not follow the instructions for authors, and many do not have the DOI (those that should have it).</p>	
<p>Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p>	<p>Estimation of genetic parameters in bread wheat (<i>Triticum aestivum</i> L.) genotypes evaluated in two locations in Ethiopia</p>	
<p>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.</p>	<p>Out of 300 words allowed for this section, it has only 165, and therefore, the abstract is quite short and general. It does not indicate what PCV and GCV mean, it does not provide the best genotypes found, as well as the performance in each location. It does not mention the temperatures that prevailed during the study</p>	
<p>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p>	<p>I consider that the section of material and methods could be organized in a different way, so that there are not too many short sub-sections. Table 1 is not even mentioned in the text of the manuscript</p>	
<p>Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p>	<p>The analysis of variance, estimation of genetic parameters, is well supported by the methodology used. Data are comprehensive and well presented and discussed</p>	
<p>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form. =</p>	<p>References are sufficient and many recent; however, as it was indicated before, there are references lacking in the reference section, and references in that section that do not appear in the text of the manuscript. Also, in some references the years indicated do not match. Most references do not follow the instructions for authors, and many do not have the DOI (those that should have it)</p>	
<p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>	<p>It could be improved</p>	
<p>Optional/General comments</p>		

Review Form 3

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Guillermo Fuentes-Davila
Department, University & Country	Mexican National Institute for Forestry, Agriculture, and Livestock Research, Mexico