

Review Form 3

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Geographical Research
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJGR_124747
Title of the Manuscript:	INFLUENCE OF FOREST PLANTATION ESTABLISHMENT SCHEMES ON COMMUNITY LIVELIHOODS: A CASE OF MAKUTANO FOREST KERICHO COUNTY KENYA
Type of the Article	

Review Form 3

PART 1: Review Comments

Compulsory REVISION comments	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback (Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	This manuscript is very important to understand the direct and tangible effect of plantation forest establishment on community livelihood. This is because plantation forest establishment could be sustainable and healthy if it can fulfil two important perspective i.e., ecosystem perspective and the utilitarian perspective. Therefore, this manuscript evaluate the utilitarian perspective which is very important to address/understand the need of community livelihood while, planning plantation forest establishment.	
Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)	It is suitable: but I suggest to use the word "impact" rather than "influence". Even though these two terms are synonymy they have different impression. For instance, when we say influence it refers to the indirect and intangible effect of something on.... but when we say impact it refers to the direct and tangible effect of something on.... Anyway check it! I'm not native speaker of English language. I see that in your manuscript you have evaluated the direct and tangible benefits of forest that it provide for local community.	
Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.	The abstract is good! However, it is good to: -minimise the introduction statements and add the findings like forest land cultivation under the forest plantation establishment scheme, involvement level, type of activities and, and benefits etc. because the result part is very narrow. - include how many focus group discussions were conducted among the CBO leaders. Conclusion is missing in the abstract and I suggest you to add conclusion part.	
Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?	Yes!	
Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	The manuscript is well structured and written following the scientific methods. The contents are coherent. Even though the manuscript needs major revision, the title, objectives, methodology, results and discussion parts are go together or well organised.	
Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form. :	Better to add more such as: Alexander van der Meer Simo,2020; Tran Cuong, Tran Thi Quy Chinh, Yi Xie, 2019; Christopher Mawa, David Mwesigye Tumusiime,Fred Babweteera, Eric Okwir and John Robert Stephen Tabuti, 2023; Agevi Humphrey, Mwendwa Kaleb Adamba, Koros Hillary, Mulinya Carolyne, Kawawa Rashid Calvince, Kimutai Donald Kipruto, WabusyaMoses, Khanyufu Mercy, Jawuoro Stanely, 2016; & etc.	

Review Form 3

<p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>	<p>-Use comma appropriately. For instance look at the underlined one: “Makutano forest community is unique <u>geographically demographically</u>, socially, politically and even economically as compared to other areas where influence of PELIS to community livelihoods has been carried out.”</p> <p>-Spelling error: for example “Land is a scares resource especially among the poor populations and when made available can change their lives.” <u>Scares or scarce?</u></p> <p>- There were 14 CBOs with each having 5 leaders each. Not clear sentence (methodology part).</p> <p>- The data collected was the analyzed using.....unclear sentence (methodology part).</p>	
<p>Optional/General comments</p>	<p>-“Musyimi, (2018) notes that forests in Africa accounts for 21.4% of the total land surface which is about 674 million hectares.” Is this data includes the plantation forest as well? Indicate the data on how much plantation forest cover is there in Africa.</p> <p>-“3561.84 Ha of Makutano forest is occupied by exotic trees while 1343.01 Ha is covered by natural indigenous trees”. Here, “<u>Ha</u>” you used is <u>hectares</u> and abbreviated as “<u>ha</u>”. Indicate the appropriate abbreviation in the first word you used using bracket in the manuscript then use consistently throughout the paper.</p> <p>-Is Kericho County is part of the five major Kenya’s Water Towers?</p> <p>- “CFA”, “KFS”, “KFS “, and “CFO” what this abbreviation indicate? They may be common in Kenya but not clear for others. Use their full words and corresponding abbreviation in initial usage in the manuscript not somewhere in the body like you used in the case of forest adjacent communities (FAC).</p> <p>-Under literature review: some sentences required citation Because these sentences have data and require citation.</p> <p>For example: 1. Participatory forest management (PFM) program which started in Kenya back in 1997.....; 2. It is estimated that globally, forests support the livelihoods of 1.6 billion people. In Africa, 6% of the GDP is credited to forest and forest resources. These statistics are the highest compared to other continents.</p> <p><u>Methodology :</u></p> <p>-link Figure 1 with Location of the Study Area by writing at the end of the paragraph like this (figure 1).</p> <p>-The <u>no</u> of target population in the table is 1719 and below table you stated 1725 which is correct????????</p> <p>- use citation for the formula of assigning proportions.</p> <p><u>Results</u></p> <p>- Incomplete sentence: “The economic value of the harvests was measured against household size, education level of the.....”</p> <p>- Check for clarity (1, 2): 1. Also, those at the radius of about 2-3 kilometers from, the forests realized higher economic benefits from the sale of the harvests as compared to those at a radius of one and four to five kilometers from the forest.</p> <p>- 2. These products were from the predetermined list and they had the liberty to add to the list any other products that was from the list and they could access from the forest.</p> <p>- Wrong numbering of table: look at in the body: Table 16 below is a summary of the products available and their benefits that the community accrued from them. But it is 12.</p> <p><u>Discussion</u></p> <p>I suggest to use more references related to your research that agrees or disagrees with your findings and give justification why the case was. The references could be from Kenya /outside country perspective.</p> <p><u>Conclusions</u></p> <p>-Don’t use the findings that was not mentioned in the result part. For example : The sale of the farm produce and the other forest products have helped them diversify their income sources like buying of more daily animals for milk production, buying motorbikes for transport purposes, buying land for agriculture and settlement, among others.</p> <p>Revise your conclusion based on your findings.</p>	

Review Form 3

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Hana Tamrat Gebirehiwot
Department, University & Country	Salale University, College of Agriculture and Natural Resource, Ethiopia