

Review Form 3

| | |
|--------------------------|---|
| Journal Name: | Asian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Research |
| Manuscript Number: | Ms_AJFAR_125411 |
| Title of the Manuscript: | The Effect of variegated grasshopper meal (<i>Zonoceros variegatus</i>) on Growth, Nutrient utilization and Gene expression study in juvenile <i>Clarias gariepinus</i> (Burchell, 1822) |
| Type of the Article | Research |

Review Form 3

PART 1: Review Comments

| Compulsory REVISION comments | Reviewer's comment | Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i> |
|---|--|---|
| <p>Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p> | <p>This manuscript explores the innovative use of variegated grasshopper meal as an alternative protein source in aquaculture, potentially enhancing the sustainability of fish farming. The authors justified their topic by providing detailed investigation into how this dietary intervention affects growth, nutrient utilization, and gene expression provides valuable insights that could inform future research and aquaculture practices.</p> | |
| <p>Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p> | <p>YES</p> | |
| <p>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.</p> | <p>Abstract is well-written</p> | |
| <p>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p> | <p>Yes</p> | |
| <p>Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p> | <p>The authors employed appropriate methodologies to assess the effects of variegated grasshopper meal on growth performance and gene expression in juvenile <i>Clarias gariepinus</i>. The use of a well-established technique reverse transcriptase-polymerase chain reaction (RT-PCR) for gene expression analysis, and the statistical analysis provides a detailed understanding of the research. However, an explanation of why lower weight gain was reported in the 100% inclusion diet is required.</p> | |
| <p>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.</p> | <p>Yes. However, references more specific to <i>Clarias gariepinus</i> could be included especially in the introduction and discussion.</p> | |

Review Form 3

| | | |
|--|--|--|
| <p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p> | <p>Minor language revision for grammatical correctness is required</p> | |
| <p>Optional/General comments</p> | <p>Here are my additional comments.</p> <p>Fish feed accounts for roughly 40% to 60% of production costs in [4-5]. In where?</p> <p>Additional information on why it is important to study the different genes studied by the authors should be included in the introduction.</p> <p>Experimental site: Please provide information on when the study was conducted.</p> <p>4mm feed size appears too large for fish with an average weight of 10.0 g ± 0.2g. Was the feed fed to fish directly or crushed?</p> <p>You wrote “Four of the treatments in each experiment were fed variegated grasshopper meal based diets and maggot meal based diets at varying concentration while the remaining group served as control diet”.</p> <p>With reference to Table 1, no maggot meal was included in the diet composition and hence confusing to see maggot meal being mentioned here.</p> <p>Is your equation 1 for weight gain or mean weight gain? Please verify. Same as equation 2. Refer to Table 1. This could have had serious impact on the results and discussion.</p> <p>How was the variegated grasshopper meal processed and What is the protein content of the variegated grasshopper meal?</p> <p>Did you analyze the VGMD experimental diets for their protein content after formulation?</p> <p>Is there a reason for the low weight gain observed at 100% inclusion?</p> <p>The conclusion should be improved.</p> | |

PART 2:

| | | |
|--|---|---|
| | <p>Reviewer’s comment</p> | <p>Author’s comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</p> |
| <p>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</p> | <p><i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i></p> | |

Reviewer Details:

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>Name:</p> | <p>Akinloye Emmanuel Ojewole</p> |
| <p>Department, University & Country</p> | <p>Southern Illinois University, USA</p> |