

**Review Form 3**

|                          |  |
|--------------------------|--|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">Asian Journal of Environment &amp; Ecology</a>   |
| Manuscript Number:       | Ms_AJEE_125469   |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Enhancing Aquaculture Productivity through Integrated Farming Systems: A Comparative Study of Fish-Pig and Fish-Duck Systems |
| Type of the Article      | Original research article  |

**Review Form 3**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

| <b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments  | <b>Reviewer's comment</b>  | <b>Author's Feedback</b> (Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|--|--|---|
| <p>Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community.<br/>Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript?<br/>A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p>                        | <p>Integrated farming systems involving fish-animal are of high relevance in current scenario. Studies like this asses the suitability of such systems in improving the aquaculture productivity and overall benefits to the ecosystem.</p>  |   |
| <p>Is the title of the article suitable?<br/>(If not please suggest an alternative title)</p>  | <p>The title of the article is apt and clearly convey what the article deals with.</p>   |   |
| <p>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?<br/>Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section?<br/>Please write your suggestions here.</p>   | <p>The abstract has all relevant information about the content of the article. However, minor grammatical mistakes are observed. It is also advised to write scientific names in italics.</p>  |   |
| <p>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p>  | <p>Subsections of manuscript could be improved. For example instead of writing plankton, it could be rewritten as plankton density and diversity. Materials and methods section lack details on how ducks were reared and the type of feeds fed to them. Please include this.</p>  |   |
| <p>Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript.<br/>Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound?<br/>A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p> | <p>The research is scientifically correct. However more clarity on result of statistical analysis on data could be included.</p>   |   |
| <p>Are the references sufficient and recent?<br/>If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.</p>   | <p>The author has provided relevant and sufficient number of references. However, it would be better to cite references which are recent.</p>  |   |
| <p><u>Minor</u> REVISION comments</p> <p>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>   | <p>Yes, the language is found suitable.</p>  |   |
| <p><b>Optional/General</b> comments</p>  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The article is based on a single season data. It is advised to repeat the experiment over the next season for a much better conclusion on the result if the research is ongoing.</li> <li>Scientific names wherever found in the manuscript should be written in italics.</li> </ul> <p>No, there are no ethical issues in the manuscript.<br/>Plagiarism not suspected</p> |   |

**Review Form 3**

**PART 2:**

|   | <b>Reviewer's comment</b>  | <b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|---|--|--|
| <b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b> | <i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i> |  |

**Reviewer Details:**

|                                  |  |
|----------------------------------|--|
| Name:                            | <b>Jince Mary M. Joy</b>                     |
| Department, University & Country | <b>Kerala Agricultural University, India</b> |