

Review Form 3

Journal Name:	Journal of Complementary and Alternative Medical Research
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JOCAMR_124359
Title of the Manuscript:	NUTRITIONAL GENOMICS: THE USE OF PERSONALIZED DIETS FOR MANAGING DEPRESSION
Type of the Article	Review Article

Review Form 3

PART 1: Review Comments

Compulsory REVISION comments	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.		
Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)		
Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.		
Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?		
Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.		
Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form. =		

Review Form 3

<p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>		
<p>Optional/General comments</p>	<p>Overall Comments: The manuscript is comprehensive, well-structured, and addresses a timely topic.</p> <p>Suggestions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">- Include visual aids such as tables, diagrams, or infographics to summarize complex information (e.g., gene-diet interactions, nutrient impacts on gene expression).- Discuss how personalized nutrition could be practically implemented in clinical settings, including potential barriers and solutions. <p>Suggestions for Improvement of Abstract: Objective Clarity: Clearly state the main objective or purpose of the review. Consider including a sentence like "This review aims to explore the role of nutritional genomics in developing personalized dietary strategies for managing depression." Briefly mention the methods or approach used for gathering and analyzing data, such as the databases searched or types of studies reviewed. Include a concise summary of the most important findings, such as specific genes or nutrients associated with depression. This will give readers an idea of what to expect in the full article. Highlight the practical implications of your findings. For example, mention how this research could contribute to developing personalized dietary interventions for individuals with depression.</p> <p>1. Introduction: The introduction sets the stage well, outlining the relevance of personalized diets for depression. You provide a clear context regarding the importance of nutritional genomics.</p> <p>Suggestions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">- Clearly state the aim and objectives of the review in the introduction. It will help the reader understand the structure of the manuscript from the outset.- You might consider briefly mentioning the potential mechanisms by which diet influences depression. <p>2. Nutritional Genomics and Depression: You provide a comprehensive overview of the genes and nutrients involved in depression.</p> <p>Suggestions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">- Include more evidence linking specific dietary components to changes in gene expression in the context of depression.- Elaborate on how nutritional genomics can bridge the gap between generic dietary recommendations and personalized treatment for mental health issues. <p>3. Key Nutrients Influencing Depression: This section is quite informative, detailing how various nutrients like vitamin B6, B12, D, and omega-3 fatty acids relate to depression.</p> <p>Suggestions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">- Strengthen this section by providing more evidence from randomized controlled trials (RCTs) that show the effectiveness of these nutrients in managing depression.- Compare the impact of dietary intake versus supplementation in influencing mental health outcomes. <p>4. Genetic Variability and Nutrient Metabolisms in Depression: The explanation of how genetic variations affect nutrient metabolism is thorough.</p> <p>Suggestions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">- Highlight how this variability could be accounted for when developing personalized diets for depression management.- Provide more case studies or examples that clearly demonstrate how genetic differences influence the efficacy of dietary interventions in depression.	

Review Form 3

	<p>5. Gene-Diet Interactions in Depression: This section effectively explains the interaction between genes and dietary components. Suggestions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Consider integrating graphical elements or flowcharts to illustrate the pathways and interactions between genes and nutrients. - Discuss more about how lifestyle factors such as stress, sleep, and physical activity could interact with these genetic variations, influencing dietary responses. <p>6. Methodology: It's commendable that you mention the databases and search keywords used. Suggestions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Provide details about the inclusion and exclusion criteria for the studies reviewed. - Include a brief section on how data was synthesized and any quality assessment tools used, such as PRISMA or Cochrane guidelines. <p>7. Implications for Practice and Future Research: You've highlighted the potential of personalized nutrition in managing depression. Suggestions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Discuss the challenges and ethical considerations of using genetic information to create personalized diets. This will help make your review more comprehensive. - Suggest areas where more research is needed, such as large-scale clinical trials or studies in diverse populations. <p>8. Conclusion: The conclusion effectively summarizes the review. Suggestions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Emphasize the importance of interdisciplinary collaboration (nutritionists, geneticists, mental health professionals) for successful implementation of personalized diets for depression. - End with a call to action for more robust research in this field to bridge current knowledge gaps. <p>Language and Style: The language used is professional and appropriate for a scientific audience. Suggestions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Ensure clarity and conciseness by reducing redundancy in some paragraphs. - Improve readability by breaking up long sentences into shorter, more digestible ones. <p>References: The references seem extensive and relevant. Suggestions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Ensure all citations are up-to-date, and consider including more recent studies to make your review current. - Recheck the formatting to ensure consistency, as some citation styles (numbers in square brackets) differ across the manuscript. 	
--	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Review Form 3

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Omazia Nasir
Department, University & Country	Quaid-i-Azam University, Pakistan