

**Review Form 3**

Journal Name:	<a href="#">Journal of Agriculture and Ecology Research International</a>
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JAERI_125090
Title of the Manuscript:	<b>Agricultural valorization of treated effluent from Korhogo wastewater treatment plant</b>
Type of the Article	<b>Research paper</b>

### Review Form 3

#### **PART 1: Review Comments**

<b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's Feedback</b> (Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<b>Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</b>	Wastewater from domestic and municipal resources creates opportunities for farmers to utilize for crop irrigation as it contains organic matter and is rich in macro and micronutrients. It is virtuous alternative of harmful agrochemical fertilizers. The present study is based on wastewater irrigation for crops that can be usual for farmers by presenting its characteristics with permissible limits of WHO standards.	
<b>Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</b>	Yes	
<b>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.</b>	Acceptable	
<b>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</b>	Yes	
<b>Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</b>	Wastewater is a rich source of essential nutrients for the growth of plants. But, the plant growth depends on the quality of applied water as well as the variety of crops that tolerate their characteristics. In the present research, the characteristics of the treated wastewater from Korhogo wastewater treatment plant have been studied that showed permissible limits of WHO standards. This study is useful for the irrigation of agricultural fields as it also carries several minerals for plant growth and yield. However, it contains some errors in the manuscript that should be fixed.	
<b>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.</b> =	The references are old except two, (1) 2020 and (26) 2021. Add the latest references, some are suggested, <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Shah, P., Abid, M., Kousar Yasmeen, T.N., Hakeem, A., Shaikh, N.J., Basheer, N., Darban, D. And Khan, A., 2022. Quality measurements of various types of wastewaters and their impacts on plant growth. <i>Pak. J. Bot</i>, 54(2), pp.629-637.</li> <li>• Shah, P., Abid, M., Basheer, N., Sitara, U., Yasmeen, K., Shaikh, A.H., Jabeen, N., Abbasi, M.W. And Hanif, A., 2024. A study on inhabitant microorganisms isolated from wastewater irrigated soils of Karachi, Pakistan. <i>Pak. J. Bot</i>, 56(6), Pp.2465-2472.</li> <li>• Basheer, N., Shah, P., Shaikh, A.H. and Abid, M., 2022. Exploitation of agricultural detritus for the improvement of plant growth. <i>GU Journal of Phytosciences</i>, 2(3), pp.181-186.</li> <li>• Shah, P., Abid, M., Abbas, A., Basheer, N., Sheikh, A.H., Jabeen, N. and Sitara, U., 2020. Screening of <i>Trichoderma viride</i> as a bio-control agent against different soil-borne infectious and phytopathogenic fungi. <i>Int. J. Biol. Biotech</i>, 17(2), pp.405-410.</li> </ul>	

**Review Form 3**

<p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p><b>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</b></p>	<p>The manuscript contains spelling mistakes and grammar mistakes that should be fixed.</p>	
<p><b>Optional/General</b> comments</p>	<p>1. The author should give a brief introduction regarding the Korhogo wastewater treatment plant in the manuscript as the wastewater of this treatment plant is the main objective of the study.</p> <p>2. Avoid repetition of the paper title within the manuscript, as it has been written again in the introduction.</p> <p>3. The objective of the study should be re-write.</p> <p>4. Headings in material and methods are not appropriate i.e. 2.1. Material, 2.1.1. Water and data analysis..</p> <p>5. Be careful in writing upper and lower case e.g. in Material and methods: ...Measurements of PH and Temperature....</p> <p>6. Plants' scientific names must be written with rules e.g. names are not in italics.</p> <p>7. References of the methods are not complete, reference paper with author's name and year must be shown.</p> <p>8. In table 1, full words of abbreviations must be written below the table as a note.</p> <p>9. The manuscript contains spelling mistakes and grammar mistakes that should be fixed.</p> <p>10. In the result section, the germination rate and microbiological results are only written in the text but have not been presented in table/graph form. The table/graph presentation is missing.</p> <p>11. In the reference section, references are not written according to the journal rules, fix them.</p> <p>12. The references are old except for two, (1) 2020 and (26) 2021. Add the latest references, some are suggested,</p> <p>□ Shah, P., Abid, M., Kousar Yasmeen, T.N., Hakeem, A., Shaikh, N.J., Basheer, N., Darban, D. And Khan, A., 2022. Quality measurements of various types of wastewaters and their impacts on plant growth. Pak. J. Bot, 54(2), pp.629-637.</p> <p>□ Shah, P., Abid, M., Basheer, N., Sitara, U., Yasmeen, K., Shaikh, A.H., Jabeen, N., Abbasi, M.W. And Hanif, A., 2024. A study on inhabitant microorganisms isolated from wastewater irrigated soils of Karachi, Pakistan. Pak. J. Bot, 56(6), Pp.2465-2472.</p> <p>□ Basheer, N., Shah, P., Shaikh, A.H. and Abid, M., 2022. Exploitation of agricultural detritus for the improvement of plant growth. GU Journal of Phytosciences, 2(3), pp.181-186.</p> <p>□ Shah, P., Abid, M., Abbas, A., Basheer, N., Sheikh, A.H., Jabeen, N. and Sitara, U., 2020. Screening of Trichoderma viride as a bio-control agent against different soil-borne infectious and phytopathogenic fungi. Int. J. Biol. Biotech, 17(2), pp.405-410.</p>	

**PART 2:**

	<p><b>Reviewer's comment</b></p>	<p><b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</p>
<p><b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b></p>	<p><i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i></p>	

**Reviewer Details:**

<p>Name:</p>	<p><b>Paras Shah</b></p>
<p>Department, University &amp; Country</p>	<p><b>Hainan University, China</b></p>