

Review Form 3

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Environment & Ecology
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJEE_124976
Title of the Manuscript:	The Influence of Coral Reef Benthic Conditions on Associated Fish Assemblages Around Puruf Island Water, Cenderawasih Bay, Papua, Indonesia
Type of the Article	

Review Form 3

PART 1: Review Comments

Compulsory REVISION comments	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback (<i>Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here</i>)
Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.		
Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)		
Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.		
Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?		
Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.		
Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.		

Review Form 3

<p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>		
<p><u>Optional/General</u> comments</p>	<p>Comments</p> <p>Here are some recommendations for improving specific sections of the paper:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Need improvement in the English language throughout the manuscript 2. The abstract provides a good overview but could benefit from more clarity and structure. Specifically: Clarify the Results: Specify the "strong interaction" between fish and coral lifeforms with more detail on which types of fish (herbivores or carnivores) are most affected and how. Add Data: Include one or two key statistics (e.g., coral cover percentages or specific fish population trends) to make the findings more concrete. Conclude with Impact: End with a broader implication of the study for coral reef conservation or fisheries management. 3. The introduction is informative but a bit dense, and some parts could be streamlined to improve readability. 4. The methods section is well-explained; however, the manuscript would benefit from providing more detailed information about the study area. Including the latitude and longitude coordinates would offer greater clarity regarding the geographical context and improve the study's reproducibility by allowing future researchers to locate the specific area of interest accurately. 5. The conclusion could be more impactful by emphasizing the broader relevance of the study. 6. Based on the findings, add a final sentence suggesting further research or specific actions for coral reef management in the conclusion. 	

PART 2:

	<p>Reviewer's comment</p>	<p>Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</p>
<p>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</p>	<p><i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i></p>	

Reviewer Details:

<p>Name:</p>	<p>Zaheer Abass</p>
<p>Department, University & Country</p>	<p>Sher-e-Kashmir University of Agricultural Sciences and Technology of Kashmir, India</p>