

**Review Form 3**

Journal Name:	<a href="#">Asian Journal of Biology</a>
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJOB_124656
Title of the Manuscript:	<b>Analysis of Proximate Composition of Shingi fish (<i>Heteropneustes fossilis</i>) Fed with Poultry Offal Protein-Rich Formulated Feed under Captive Conditions</b>
Type of the Article	

**Review Form 3**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

<b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>																																																											
Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	The work is of applied value to boost up aquacultural product.																																																												
Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)	Title is ok.																																																												
Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.	It is clumsy, lack clarity. It should be concised. Only protein weight in diet is not important, its digestibility and conversion efficiency is also to be taken into account in such studies.																																																												
Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?	Raw data (i.e Body weight, protein weight both in control and experimental fishes besides growth rate per fish per day could have make the study more meaningful.																																																												
Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	<p>Paper can be published after incorporation data as suggested in above paragraph and comments on page 3 &amp; page 8 of the manuscript.</p> <p>Table 1. Inclusion levels of different feed ingredients</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="842 1102 1982 1730"> <thead> <tr> <th rowspan="2">Ingredients</th> <th colspan="4">Inclusion level (%)</th> </tr> <tr> <th>Diet-1</th> <th>Diet-2</th> <th>Diet-3</th> <th>Diet-4</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Fish meal</td> <td>30.00</td> <td>20.00</td> <td>10.00</td> <td>0.00</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Poultry offal Meal</td> <td>0.00</td> <td>10.00</td> <td>20.00</td> <td>30.00</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Wheat bran</td> <td>11.45</td> <td>11.45</td> <td>11.45</td> <td>11.45</td> </tr> <tr> <td>De-oil rice bran</td> <td>11.45</td> <td>11.45</td> <td>11.45</td> <td>11.45</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Rapeseed meal</td> <td>21.05</td> <td>21.05</td> <td>21.05</td> <td>21.05</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Soybean meal</td> <td>22.20</td> <td>22.20</td> <td>22.20</td> <td>22.20</td> </tr> <tr> <td>V &amp; M</td> <td>2.00</td> <td>2.00</td> <td>2.00</td> <td>2.00</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Binder</td> <td>3.00</td> <td>3.00</td> <td>3.00</td> <td>3.00</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Total</td> <td><u>100</u></td> <td><u>100</u></td> <td><u>100</u></td> <td><u>100</u></td> </tr> <tr> <td></td> <td>101.15</td> <td>101.15</td> <td>101.15</td> <td>101.15</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Ingredients	Inclusion level (%)				Diet-1	Diet-2	Diet-3	Diet-4	Fish meal	30.00	20.00	10.00	0.00	Poultry offal Meal	0.00	10.00	20.00	30.00	Wheat bran	11.45	11.45	11.45	11.45	De-oil rice bran	11.45	11.45	11.45	11.45	Rapeseed meal	21.05	21.05	21.05	21.05	Soybean meal	22.20	22.20	22.20	22.20	V & M	2.00	2.00	2.00	2.00	Binder	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00	Total	<u>100</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>100</u>		101.15	101.15	101.15	101.15	
Ingredients	Inclusion level (%)																																																												
	Diet-1	Diet-2	Diet-3	Diet-4																																																									
Fish meal	30.00	20.00	10.00	0.00																																																									
Poultry offal Meal	0.00	10.00	20.00	30.00																																																									
Wheat bran	11.45	11.45	11.45	11.45																																																									
De-oil rice bran	11.45	11.45	11.45	11.45																																																									
Rapeseed meal	21.05	21.05	21.05	21.05																																																									
Soybean meal	22.20	22.20	22.20	22.20																																																									
V & M	2.00	2.00	2.00	2.00																																																									
Binder	3.00	3.00	3.00	3.00																																																									
Total	<u>100</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>100</u>																																																									
	101.15	101.15	101.15	101.15																																																									
Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.	Yes																																																												

### Review Form 3

Minor REVISION comments <b>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</b>	It is OK, but lack flow	
<b>Optional/General</b> comments	After minor correction in manuscript & incorporation of few data (as suggested above) it can be published.	

### **PART 2:**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b>	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

### **Reviewer Details:**

Name:	<b>Reshman Yasmin</b>
Department, University & Country	<b>Gaya College, India</b>