

**Review Form 1.7**

Journal Name:	<b>Journal of Scientific Research and Reports</b>
Manuscript Number:	<b>Ms_JSRR_113559</b>
Title of the Manuscript:	<b>INSECTICIDAL ACTIVITY OF DIFFERENT DOSES OF ACORUS CALAMUS ESSENTIAL OIL AGAINST SITOPHILUS ORYZAE</b>
Type of the Article	<b>Original Research Article</b>

[Review Form 1.7](#)

**PART 1: Review Comments**

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p><b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>Is the manuscript important for scientific community?</b> (Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</li> <li>2. <b>Is the title of the article suitable?</b> (If not please suggest an alternative title)</li> <li>3. <b>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</b></li> <li>4. <b>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</b></li> <li>5. <b>Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</b></li> <li>6. <b>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</b></li> </ol> <p><b><u>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</u></b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The subject is interesting because the search for alternative methods of ecological control against harmful insects is at the center of the current concerns of researchers.</li> <li>• The title of the article suitable</li> <li>• The results obtained are interesting</li> </ul> <p><b>However, in our opinion, this article cannot be accepted in its current form and requires major corrections:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>The introduction</b> needs to be updated; Most of the references cited are very old. I have attached some interesting documents that can be used in this sense.  None of the references cited really addresses the subject of the study, namely: The effect of the essential oil of <i>Acorus calamus</i> in the biocontrol of <i>Sitophilus oryzae</i> or even another species of this genus. I suggest you read the article by Aryal et al., (2023) (<a href="https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2023.e22130">https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2023.e22130</a>)</li> <li>• <b>In the materials and methods section</b>, many details are missing: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The variety of rice used in the test was not reported.</li> <li>- The method used for the treatment of seeds with different concentrations of the essential oil of the plant studied has not been presented.</li> <li>- The number of repetitions performed for each concentration is not mentioned.</li> <li>- It is necessary to specify the harvest season of <i>Acorus calamus</i> samples because it has been shown that the composition of the essential oil of this plant varies according to the seasons (see article by Parki et al., (2017); Medicines <b>2017</b>, 4, 81; doi:10.3390/medicines4040081) .</li> </ul> </li> <li>• <b>In the result and discussion section:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The same results presented in tabular form were presented in the figure. the figure in fact provides no additional information. you must therefore choose to present your results either in table form or in figure form but not both, it is simple repetition.</li> <li>- <b>Discussion</b> of the results is almost absent.</li> </ul> </li> <li>• <b>The conclusion</b> is correct, it should only be noted that toxicological studies are necessary before any use of the essential oil of <i>Acorus calamus</i>, given that one of the components of the essential oil of this plant (<math>\beta</math> asarone) is known to be carcinogenic and toxic to humans (see: <a href="https://doi.org/10.3389/fphar.2015.00025">https://doi.org/10.3389/fphar.2015.00025</a>).</li> </ul>	

**Review Form 1.7**

<b>Minor</b> REVISION comments		
1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?		
<b>Optional/General</b> comments		

**PART 2:**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

**Reviewer Details:**

Name:	<b>Nabila El Alami</b>
Department, University & Country	<b>Moulay Ismail University of Meknes, Morocco</b>