

**Review Form 1.7**

Journal Name:	<b>Journal of Advances in Biology &amp; Biotechnology</b>
Manuscript Number:	<b>Ms_JABB_116576</b>
Title of the Manuscript:	<b>Effect of Different Growing Media on Seed Germination, Seedling Growth And Establishment of Papaya (Carica papaya L.) cv. Red Lady</b>
Type of the Article	

## Review Form 1.7

### PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p><b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>Is the manuscript important for scientific community?</b> (Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</li> <li>2. <b>Is the title of the article suitable?</b> (If not please suggest an alternative title)</li> <li>3. <b>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</b></li> <li>4. <b>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</b></li> <li>5. <b>Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</b></li> <li>6. <b>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</b></li> </ol> <p><b>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</b></p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The topic has studied and published in 2021, the title is Effect of different Types of Media and Containers on Germination, Survival, Growth and Establishment of Papaya (Carica papaya L.) cv. Red Lady under Protected Condition. In Reviewer opinions the manuscript with tittle Effect of Different Growing Media on Seed Germination, Seedling Growth And Establishment of Papaya (Carica papaya L.) cv. Red Lady is lack of novelties.</li> <li>2. The reviewer advises that the title manuscript is Effect of Composition the Growing Media on Seed Germination, Seedling Growth And Establishment of Papaya (Carica papaya L.) cv. Red Lady</li> <li>3. The abstract of the article is not comprehensive. In the abstract stated that plastic containers are found to be better followed by earthen pots and polybags, but in the manuscript there are no experiments or results that scientifically support this statement.</li> <li>4. The author should present the results of each experimental variation complete with the results of the observed parameters in a table. It will help readers to understand the results of the research conducted. The author could refer to Table 2 of the article in this link <a href="https://www.researchtrend.net/bfij/pdf/97%20Effect%20of%20different%20Types%20of%20Media%20and%20Containers%20on%20Germination,%20Survival,%20Growth%20and%20Establishment%20of%20Papaya%20_Carica%20papaya%20L.%20cv.%20Red%20Lady%20under%20Protected%20Condition%20Pragya%20Shrivastava%20988.pdf">https://www.researchtrend.net/bfij/pdf/97%20Effect%20of%20different%20Types%20of%20Media%20and%20Containers%20on%20Germination,%20Survival,%20Growth%20and%20Establishment%20of%20Papaya%20_Carica%20papaya%20L.%20cv.%20Red%20Lady%20under%20Protected%20Condition%20Pragya%20Shrivastava%20988.pdf</a></li> <li>5. Yes, the manuscript is scientifically correct because it has a clear methodology.</li> <li>6. The references are not sufficient, below are some additional references               <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <a href="https://www.researchtrend.net/bfij/pdf/97%20Effect%20of%20different%20Types%20of%20Media%20and%20Containers%20on%20Germination,%20Survival,%20Growth%20and%20Establishment%20of%20Papaya%20_Carica%20papaya%20L.%20cv.%20Red%20Lady%20under%20Protected%20Condition%20Pragya%20Shrivastava%20988.pdf">https://www.researchtrend.net/bfij/pdf/97%20Effect%20of%20different%20Types%20of%20Media%20and%20Containers%20on%20Germination,%20Survival,%20Growth%20and%20Establishment%20of%20Papaya%20_Carica%20papaya%20L.%20cv.%20Red%20Lady%20under%20Protected%20Condition%20Pragya%20Shrivastava%20988.pdf</a></li> <li>2. <a href="https://www.researchgate.net/publication/373713646_Effects_of_Different_Growing_Media_on_Germination_Growth_Performance_and_Biomass_of_Papaya_Seedlings_at_Nursery_Stage">https://www.researchgate.net/publication/373713646_Effects_of_Different_Growing_Media_on_Germination_Growth_Performance_and_Biomass_of_Papaya_Seedlings_at_Nursery_Stage</a></li> </ol> </li> </ol> <p style="text-align: center;">ADDITIONAL COMMENTS</p> <p>Based on what you determine the media type and composition of your experiment. Do you use references or research that has been carried out by previous researchers?</p> <p>Media at nine levels viz. T<sub>0</sub>: control, T<sub>1</sub>: Soil + FYM (1:1), T<sub>2</sub>: Soil + Cocopeat (1:1), T<sub>3</sub>: Soil + Vermicompost (1:1), T<sub>4</sub>: Soil + FYM + Cocopeat (1:1:1), T<sub>5</sub>: Soil + FYM + Vermicompost (1:1:1), T<sub>6</sub>: Soil + FYM + Cocopeat (1:2:1), T<sub>7</sub>: Soil + Vermicompost + Cocopeat (1:2:1) and T<sub>8</sub>: Soil + FYM + Cocopeat + Vermicompost (1:1:1:1).</p>	
<p><b>Minor</b> REVISION comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</b></li> </ol>	<p>there are no issues regarding the quality of the language/English articles for scientific communication</p>	

**Review Form 1.7**

<b>Optional/General</b> comments		
----------------------------------	--	--

**PART 2:**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b>	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

**Reviewer Details:**

Name:	<b>Indah Prihatiningtyas D.S.</b>
Department, University & Country	<b>Mulawarman University, Indonesia</b>