

## Review Form 1.7

|                          |   |
|--------------------------|---|
| Journal Name:            | <b>Advances in Research</b>   |
| Manuscript Number:       | <b>Ms_AIR_116593</b>  |
| Title of the Manuscript: | <b>Bovine renal lipofuscinosis in a Tanzanian crossbred yearling male calf: A case report</b> |
| Type of the Article      | <b>Case report</b>  |

### **General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<https://www.journalair.com/index.php/AIR/editorial-policy> )

**Review Form 1.7**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

|   | <b>Reviewer's comment</b>  | <b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|---|--|--|
| <p><b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>Is the manuscript important for scientific community?</b><br/>(Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</li> <li>2. <b>Is the title of the article suitable?</b><br/>(If not please suggest an alternative title)</li> <li>3. <b>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</b></li> <li>4. <b>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</b></li> <li>5. <b>Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</b></li> <li>6. <b>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</b></li> </ol> <p><u>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</u></p> | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) <b>Importance for the Scientific Community:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>♦ The manuscript discusses a rare case of <b>bovine renal lipofuscinosis (BRL)</b>, which was incidentally encountered during necropsy.</li> <li>♦ While BRL is not commonly reported in cattle, this case provides valuable information for veterinarians, researchers, and pathologists.</li> <li>♦ Understanding the clinical presentation, gross pathology, and differential diagnosis of BRL can contribute to the field of veterinary medicine.</li> <li>♦ Therefore, the manuscript could be considered important for the scientific community, especially those interested in bovine health and pathology.</li> </ul> </li> <li>2) <b>Suitability of the title:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>♦ The title, "<b>Bovine Renal Lipofuscinosis in a Tanzanian Crossbred Yearling Male Calf: A Case Report</b>," accurately reflects the content of the manuscript.</li> <li>♦ It specifies the species (bovine), the affected organ (renal), the condition (lipofuscinosis), and the context (Tanzanian crossbred yearling male calf).</li> <li>♦ Overall, the title is informative and appropriate.</li> </ul> </li> <li>3) <b>Comprehensiveness of the Abstract:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>♦ The abstract of the article is adequate in conveying essential information about the case report.</li> <li>♦ It covers the aim, presentation of the case, diagnosis, discussion, and conclusion.</li> <li>♦ However, additional details on the significance of bovine renal lipofuscinosis (BRL) could enhance comprehensiveness.</li> </ul> </li> <li>4) <b>Subsections and Manuscript Structure:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>♦ The manuscript follows a logical structure with appropriate subsections.</li> <li>♦ It includes sections on introduction, presentation of the case, discussion, and conclusion.</li> <li>♦ The flow of information is clear and organized.</li> </ul> </li> <li>5) <b>Scientific Correctness:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>♦ The manuscript appears scientifically correct based on the provided information.</li> <li>♦ It adheres to established knowledge about BRL, differential diagnoses, and necropsy findings.</li> </ul> </li> <li>6) <b>References:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>♦ The references provided cover relevant literature on BRL, iron storage diseases, and related topics.</li> <li>♦ Some references are older, but they are foundational studies.</li> <li>♦ Additional recent references could enhance the manuscript's currency.</li> </ul> </li> </ol> <p>Overall, the manuscript is well-structured and scientifically sound. Consider supplementing with more recent references to strengthen its context and relevance.</p> |  |
| <p><b>Minor</b> REVISION comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</b></li> </ol>   | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Based on the information provided, the language quality of the article appears suitable for scholarly communications. The manuscript follows a structured format, conveys essential details, and adheres to scientific terminology.</li> </ol>   |  |

**Review Form 1.7**

**PART 2:**

|   | <b>Reviewer's comment</b>  | <b>Author's comment</b> <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i> |
|---|--|---|
| <b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b> | <i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i> |   |

**Reviewer Details:**

|                                  |                                      |
|----------------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| Name:                            | <b>Bekiyad Shasho Daro</b>           |
| Department, University & Country | <b>Haramaya University, Ethiopia</b> |