

Review Form 1.7

Journal Name:	Journal of Experimental Agriculture International
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JEAI_116877
Title of the Manuscript:	Evaluation of reproductive and developmental traits in new breeds and hybrids of bivoltine silkworm (Bombyx mori L.)
Type of the Article	Research article

Review Form 1.7

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p>Compulsory REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is the manuscript important for scientific community? (Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</p> <p>2. Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p> <p>3. Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</p> <p>4. Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p> <p>5. Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</p> <p>6. Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of</p>	<p>1. Yes it is, however, the manuscript is needed to give more details, see comments below;</p> <p>2. It can be, for example; 2.1 Evaluation of characteristics traits of new bivoltine hybrid strains of Bombyx mori. 2.2 Evaluation of reproductive performance and growth parameters on new bivoltine hybrid trains of silkworm, Bombyx mori L. 2.3 Etc.</p> <p>'reproductive performance'; fecundity (number of eggs laying per female moth), hatching ratio, atrophied eggs (dead eggs)see Patnaik et al. 2013 DOI: DOI: 10.7852/ijie.2013.26.1.022 'growth parameters' ; pupation ratio (%), pupal weight(g), survival ratio (%) from hatching to the fifth instar larva Therefore, the word 'reproductive parameters should be replaced by reproductive performance or reproductive indicators</p> <p>3. The abstract should be concised (concise summary/comprehension)</p> <p>4.1 Introduction part ;</p> <p>4.1.1 "the thermotolerant strains" if the silkworm strains are tolerance to low or high temperature? Specially in this experiment used bivoltine x bivoltine which they are originated from low temperature countries such as Chinese races and Japanese races. 4.1.2 what is " popular CSR breed" how or in what way of their popular? Please describe if they have high silk products? 4.1.3 " Traditional breeding methods have successfully produced productive silkworm breeds in India. However, pure silkworm races often exhibit a negative correlation between high cocoon shell ratio and low pupation rate, (Ref ?)" Please referred to the reference</p> <p>4.2 Materials and methods part should be given in more details. It is not clear how authors prepared/conducted the experiments. 4.2.1 silkworm lines preparation; egg incubation, for how many day (s), temperature 4.2.2 silkworm rearing conditions such as environmental rearing room; temperature, humidity, light 4.2.3 feeding time; how many meal (mulberry leaves) fed silkworms in a day 4.2.4 the food (mulberry leaves) should be counted or weight to be the same amount in each experiment 4.2.5 experimental design; 'After third moult, 200 larvae with three replications each for all the breeds and hybrids were maintained'; 4.2.5.1 This 200 larvae per replication or 200 larvae for 3 replications? 4.2.5.2 how to prepare the 200 larvae ? have they done by 200 larvae at the beginning or they were pooled then splited to be 200 larvae after the 3rd moult? Please authors give more details how to prepare silkworms for the experiment. 4.2.6 how many rearing season? It has been only mentioned that 'during 2022-2023' 4.2.6 according to evaluate the new silkworm hybrid strains, the silk yield (cocoon characters) such as fresh cocoon weight, shell weight, shell ratio are the important keys in term of ' evaluation of ne w hybrid strains'. This information is important to be introduced as new breeds</p>	

Review Form 1.7

additional references, please mention in the review form. <u>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</u>	4.2.7 'fecundity' study; male – female moth mating should be mentioned, if they were separated by individual mating (1 male : 1 female) or they were random mating 7. All references in text – citation must be numbering style (according to Journal Experimental Agriculture International' Reference style). Authors carefully check all references in the reference part. There is no bold font	
Minor REVISION comments 1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?	yes	
Optional/General comments		

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Siripuk Suraporn
Department, University & Country	Maharakham University, Thailand