

Review Form 1.7

Journal Name:	Journal of Scientific Research and Reports
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JSRR_114985
Title of the Manuscript:	Structural Integrity Assessment of Inverted Umbrella Rainwater Harvesting Systems: A STAAD-PRO Analysis
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p>Compulsory REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is the manuscript important for scientific community? Not much.</p> <p>2. Is the title of the article suitable? No. "Static load analysis of inverted umbrella structure for rain water harvesting"</p> <p>3. Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Yes</p> <p>4. Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate? Yes</p> <p>5. Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct? Yes</p> <p>6. Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</p> <p><u>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</u></p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) The explanation on calculation of the loads need not to be repeated many times. 2) A 3D STAAD model of the structure must be mentioned before showing the stress contours of the structures. 3) Page 13, paragraph under "stability Analysis", the author writes about equation number 22, 23 and later 24, but there is no such equations included in the paper. Also Appendix 1 mentioned by author is not seen in the paper. 4) The analysis targeted here seems very narrow w.r.t. the steel pipe only. The T-sections being the members of the structures, must be considered for the stability analysis too. 5) Wind load is mentioned in introduction, but not considered in the analysis. More analysis results from STAAD could be obtained and mentioned. 6) Load combinations considered in STAAD are not mentioned anywhere, 7) The abstract mentions about "load-bearing capacities, stress distributions, and deformations" but, the result includes load values only. 8) The work doesn't contribute much in establishing structural stability analysis of the inverted umbrella. 9) The title includes "integrity assessment" but no such analysis or results is presented regarding the same. 10) The author have not provided enough STAAD results for analysis. 11) What joints are considered in STAAD, rigid, semi-rigid or hinged? 12) The main structural member for which the results are shown, how the height of the steel pipe is finalised ? 13) If the entire structure is taken from some reference, mention it properly. If not, then What are the criteria for deciding the sizes of the structural members ? 	
<p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications? Yes</p>		
<p>Optional/General comments</p>		

Review Form 1.7

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes. Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Swaral Ravin Naik
Department, University & Country	Government Engineering College, India