

Review Form 1.7

Journal Name:	Journal of Experimental Agriculture International
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JEAI_115001
Title of the Manuscript:	Economic cost analysis of including probiotics in the feed of caged broilers
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p>Compulsory REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is the manuscript important for scientific community? (Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</p> <p>2. Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p> <p>3. Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</p> <p>4. Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p> <p>5. Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</p> <p>6. Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</p> <p><u>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</u></p>	<p>1. Importance: The authors investigated the economic cost of including probiotics in the diets of caged broiler chickens.</p> <p>2. Title: Preferred to be modified into "Feasibility of Probiotics Supplementation in Caged Broilers" for more understanding and readability.</p> <p>3. Abstract: Provide an opening statement of one or two short sentences as a background on the problem. Many modifications were recommended to enhance the readability and understanding.</p> <p>4. Structure of the manuscript:</p> <p>a. Keywords: Properly arranged and clear.</p> <p>b. Introduction: Improperly displayed into one large paragraph. The introduction has to be assigned into three paragraphs i.e. 1. Introduction 2. Significance of the study, and 3. Aim of the study. Some modifications were suggested to enhance readability and understanding.</p> <p>c. The aim: Needs to be reformulated. Some modifications were suggested to enhance readability and understanding.</p> <p>d. Materials and methods: The section is defective and please notice the following:</p> <p>1. MUST provide the institutional ethical approval.</p> <p>2. MUST provide details on the microclimatic conditions used for rearing the experimental broilers such as temperature, relative humidity, feeding system (manual/automated), watering system (mechanism and source & type of water), lighting program, ventilation system, rodentproof, flyproof, disinfection protocol, cleaning procedures, and vaccination and treatment applied if any.</p> <p>3. Provide a section for listing and measuring the performance traits and provide a reference for it.</p> <p>4. Provide a section for listing and measuring the economic traits and provide a reference for it.</p> <p>5. Provide a statistical analysis section with details for the analysis used and the statistical model used for the analysis.</p> <p>6. Many modifications were suggested to enhance the readability and understanding of the text.</p> <p>e. Results: Reduce the illustrations of numbers and normal ranges as they are listed in tables. Many modifications were suggested to enhance the readability and understanding of the text.</p> <p>f. Discussion: Concise with poor comparison and speculation. Some modifications were suggested to enhance the readability and understanding of the text.</p> <p>g. Conclusion: Clear to a certain extent. Some modifications were suggested to enhance the readability and understanding of the text.</p> <p>h. Tables: Footnotes have to be added to tables to provide an understanding of the abbreviations.</p> <p>5. Scientific Soundness: The manuscript highlighted that mixing probiotics in poultry feed increases profit without much affecting the production cost.</p> <p>6. References: Although the references are sufficient as 30% (6 out of 20) of the listed references were published in the past five years. Preferred to update and increase the percentage to at least 35-40%. The topic contains a lot of studies including the impact of adding probiotics forms on immunity and performance.</p>	
<p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>	<p>General view: The manuscript was expressed in poor English and grammar. Professional copyediting and proofreading, proper display of the introduction section, declaring many explanations in the materials and methods section, and proper update of the references have to be carried out before resubmission to achieve publishing value.</p>	
<p>Optional/General comments</p>		

[Review Form 1.7](#)

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Essam Samir Soliman
Department, University & Country	Suez Canal University, Egypt