

Review Form 1.7

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Advances in Agricultural Research
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJAAR_114243
Title of the Manuscript:	The Dynamics Of Oil Palm Plantations In East Kalimantan
Type of the Article	

Review Form 1.7

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p>Compulsory REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is the manuscript important for scientific community? (Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</p> <p>2. Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p> <p>3. Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</p> <p>4. Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p> <p>5. Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</p> <p>6. Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</p> <p><u>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</u></p>	<p>The submitted manuscript should already provide important information on the developments discussed in the background.</p> <p>The title of the article could be better clarified by adding additional information, such as time period or specific focus, for example: "Dynamics of Oil Palm Plantations in East Kalimantan: A Case Study of 2010-2020" or "Analysis of Changes in Planting Patterns and Productivity of Oil Palm in East Kalimantan."</p> <p>The abstract provides a good overview of the research conducted and the key findings. However, it could be improved by adding more specific details about the methods used and the implications of the findings. Additionally, it would be helpful to include a brief statement about the significance of the research and potential recommendations for policy or practice based on the findings.</p> <p>Based on the provided sentence, it's difficult to determine the specific subsections and structure of the manuscript. However, it seems that the manuscript follows a logical structure by first introducing the research focus, then describing the research method, presenting key findings, and discussing the implications. To provide a more accurate assessment, it would be helpful to have a more detailed outline or description of the manuscript's subsections and structure.</p> <p>Based on the provided sentence, the manuscript appears to be scientifically correct. The research explores the impact of oil palm plantations on deforestation in East Kalimantan, Indonesia, using a qualitative descriptive analysis method. The findings suggest that there are significant challenges posed by oil palm plantations to the concept of green growth, as a substantial portion of land allocated for plantations is still forested. However, there are also opportunities to pursue more sustainable development pathways, as a majority of concessions have yet to be planted. The manuscript also highlights the role of government regulations in supporting the development of oil palm plantations but notes that their implementation faces obstacles.</p> <p>Based on the provided information, it's difficult to determine the sufficiency and recency of the references used in the manuscript. To assess this, a list of the references cited in the manuscript would be needed. However, based on the general topic of the research (oil palm sector in East Kalimantan, Indonesia), here are some suggestions for additional references that may be relevant and recent:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Colchester, M., & Jiwan, N. (2019). Land rights and oil palm development in Indonesia. <i>The Journal of Peasant Studies</i>, 46(1), 76-107. Obidzinski, K., Dermawan, A., Puntodewo, A., & Andrianto, A. (2012). Environmental and social impacts of oil palm plantations and their implications for biofuel production in Indonesia. <i>Ecology and Society</i>, 17(1), 25. Miettinen, J., Shi, C., & Liew, S. C. (2011). Deforestation rates in insular Southeast Asia between 2000 and 2010. <i>Global Change Biology</i>, 17(7), 2261-2270. Koh, L. P., & Wilcove, D. S. (2008). Is oil palm agriculture really destroying tropical biodiversity? <i>Conservation Letters</i>, 1(2), 60-64. Carlson, K. M., Curran, L. M., Ratnasari, D., Pittman, A. M., Soares-Filho, B. S., Asner, G. P., ... & Rodrigues, H. O. (2012). Committed carbon emissions, deforestation, and community land conversion from oil palm plantation expansion in West Kalimantan, Indonesia. <i>Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences</i>, 109(19), 7559-7564. 	

Review Form 1.7

	These references cover various aspects related to oil palm development, including environmental and social impacts, land rights issues, deforestation rates, and biodiversity conservation.	
Minor REVISION comments 1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?	The language and English quality of the provided sentence appear suitable for scholarly communications. The sentence is clear, well-structured, and effectively conveys the research focus, methods, and key findings. However, a more comprehensive assessment of the entire article would be needed to determine if the language quality is consistent throughout and meets the standards expected in scholarly publications.	
Optional/General comments		

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Enzo W B Siahaan
Department, University & Country	Universitas Darma Agung, Indonesia