

Review Form 1.7

Journal Name:	Journal of Experimental Agriculture International
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JEAI_112599
Title of the Manuscript:	Effect of organic and in-organic mulch on growth, yield and quality of strawberry cv. winter dawn.
Type of the Article	

Review Form 1.7

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p>Compulsory REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is the manuscript important for scientific community? (Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</p> <p>2. Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p> <p>3. Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</p> <p>4. Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p> <p>5. Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</p> <p>6. Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</p> <p>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</p>	<p>The manuscript presents relevant content for agricultural cultivation, presenting a study on the importance of using mulch in the soil, which showed interesting results. However, it needs some adjustments to make it more complete.</p> <p>Yes, the title is appropriate.</p> <p>Partly. The methodology needed to be more specific. And there are characters available for this, as the abstract can be up to 300 words.</p> <p>Yes, the subsections and structure are adequate.</p> <p>Yes, because it used the right methodology and the results were consistent.</p> <p>The references are very old and could be updated, as only 21 per cent are from the last 10 years and the rest are much older than 10 years. And in some parts of the text it is necessary to reference them. References also need to be standardised.</p>	
<p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>	<p>Proofread the entire text, as some connectives and proper punctuation are missing. As for English, I'm not qualified to judge.</p>	
<p>Optional/General comments</p>	<p>Here are some comments that can help improve the quality of the manuscript.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The article is less than 3000 words (2208), the minimum amount recommended by the authors' guidelines. Double-space the table. The figure and table present must be inserted within the text, right after mentioning them. Correct the citation of references (Example: "<i>In the text, citations should be indicated by the reference number in brackets [3].</i>") Place the references in the order they appear and not alphabetically, as instructed in the authors' guidelines ("<i>References must be listed at the end of the manuscript and numbered in the order that they appear in the text.</i>"). Change the position of the year in the references. <p>It looks like this: Ali, A. and Gaur, G.S. 2007. Effect of mulching on growth, fruit yield and quality of strawberry (<i>Fragaria x ananassa</i> Duch). Asian Journal of Horticulture. 2(1): 149-151. But it should be like this: Ali, A. and Gaur, G.S. Effect of mulching on growth, fruit yield and quality of strawberry (<i>Fragaria x ananassa</i> Duch). Asian Journal of Horticulture. 2007; 2(1): 149-151.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The summary lacks a methodology. 	

Review Form 1.7

	<ol style="list-style-type: none">8. The objective wasn't included at the end of the introduction.9. Describe the acronyms in the text (Example: TSS - in the methodology: C.D. and SE (m) in the tables).10. Explain more about the control treatment (T0).11. Reference this passage: <i>“Enhancement in plant growth attributes under T6 treatment can be due to the fact the organic mulch has suppressed the growth of weeds, which leads to the decrease in competition of nutrients for plants and also improves soil structure, enhancing its water-holding capacity and aeration to make the nutrients available for better growth of the plant.”</i>12. Where are the statistics to say that there was a significant difference? (<i>“Data recorded for the vegetative growth attributes presented in Table 1, showed that the application of organic or inorganic mulch significantly influenced the vegetative growth parameters of strawberry plants.”</i>)13. <i>“Similar finding was reported by Verma et. al. (2017), and Florentina et. al. (2013).”</i> What did these authors investigate and find? Was it strawberries, too, or another fruit? If it was another fruit, which one? Do as you did at the end of the topics Yield attributes and Quality of fruits.14. Reference this passage: <i>“An increase in nutrient availability helps in reproductive cell division, which is meiosis, which leads to an increase in the number of flowers, the number of fruits, and yield.”</i>15. Where are the statistics to say that there was a significant difference? (<i>“Data recorded for the vegetative growth attributes presented in Table 2 showed that all the quality parameters of fruits and nutrient uptake were significantly influenced by different treatments.”</i>)16. Reference this passage: <i>“The increase in berry size, Berry volume, and berry weight may be due to the increased cell division in plants, resulting in enhancing the berry parameters of the fruit.”</i>17. <i>“Notably, these findings align with research conducted by Kumar et al. (2012) and Singh et al. (2007).”</i> What did these authors investigate and find? Was it strawberries, too, or another fruit? If it was another fruit, which one? Do as you did at the end of the topics Yield attributes and Quality of fruits.18. There are other explanations for the results presented in Nutrient uptake, which go beyond humidity. We can cite, for example, the cycling of nutrients from decomposing leaves, which also involves microbiological activity. Improve this discussion and reference.19. Reference this passage: <i>“This organic mulch excels in conserving soil moisture, thereby creating an advantageous microclimate that fosters the optimal growth conditions for strawberries.”</i>20. <i>“The veracity of these findings is further underscored by the research conducted by Kumar et al. (2012) and Singh et al. (2007).”</i> What did these authors investigate and find? Was it strawberries, too, or another fruit? If it was another fruit, which one? Do as you did at the end of the topics Yield attributes and Quality of fruits.21. In the conclusion, it's repeated that there was a significant difference, but no statistics were presented to prove this. What's more, the results obtained not only demonstrate the importance of vegetation cover in conserving moisture, but also in recycling nutrients. Therefore, rewrite this topic.22. The figure was not quoted in the text and needs to be quoted before it is presented.	
--	---	--

Review Form 1.7

	According to the text, it should be cited in the topic <i>Nutrient uptake</i> . 23. As a suggestion, if a statistical analysis comparing means were presented, it would help to confirm or not this significance.	
--	--	--

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Janielle Souza Pereira
Department, University & Country	Federal University of Lavras, Brazil