

**Review Form 1.7**

Journal Name:	<b>Journal of Experimental Agriculture International</b>
Manuscript Number:	<b>Ms_JEAI_118901</b>
Title of the Manuscript:	<b>A study on the marketing efficiency of Button Mushroom in Solan district of Himachal Pradesh, India</b>
Type of the Article	<b>Original article</b>

## Review Form 1.7

### PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p><b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>Is the manuscript important for scientific community?</b> (Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</li> <li>2. <b>Is the title of the article suitable?</b> (If not please suggest an alternative title)</li> <li>3. <b>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</b></li> <li>4. <b>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</b></li> <li>5. <b>Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</b></li> <li>6. <b>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</b></li> </ol> <p><b><u>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</u></b></p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Manuscript important for scientific community: a) Arithmetic mean, weighted mean different formulae were applied to calculate various marketing concepts such as marketing margin, marketing efficiency, marketing cost, price spread and producer's share in consumer's rupee. b) The total cost experienced by retailer in channel II was Rs. 1300 per quintal out which larger cost was recognized by spoilage (Rs. 300) and least cost was experienced by weighing charges (Rs. 50). c) In this channel the cost obtained by wholesaler was Rs. 500 in which highest cost was incurred by shop rent, market charges and transportation charges which was Rs. 100 each. The cost experienced by retailer was Rs. 720 in which maximum cost was obtained by grading which was Rs. 120.</li> <li>2. <b>The title of the article is not suitable: Evaluation of the effectiveness of Button Mushroom marketing channels in Solan district of Himachal Pradesh, India</b></li> <li>3. <b>Yes</b> the abstract of the article comprehensive</li> <li>4. <b>Subsections and structure of the manuscript are appropriate.</b></li> <li>5. <b>The manuscript is scientifically correct;</b></li> <li>6. <b>The references are not sufficient and recent:</b> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) Fan, H., Trinh Thi, V. H., Zhang, W., &amp; Li, S. (2022). The influence of trade facilitation on agricultural product exports of China: empirical evidence from ASEAN countries. <i>Economic Research-Ekonomska Istraživanja</i>, 36(2). <a href="https://doi.org/10.1080/1331677X.2022.2143845">https://doi.org/10.1080/1331677X.2022.2143845</a></li> <li>2) Kastratović, R. (2023). The impact of foreign direct investment on agricultural exports: The evidence from developing countries. <i>The Journal of International Trade &amp; Economic Development</i>, 33(2), 276–293. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1080/09638199.2023.2175306">https://doi.org/10.1080/09638199.2023.2175306</a></li> <li>3) Lateef, M., &amp; Riaz, M. U. (2022). Influence of CPEC–Flagship of Belt and Road Initiative on the agricultural trade of China. <i>Journal of Chinese Economic and Business Studies</i>, 21(2), 263–280. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1080/14765284.2021.2024485">https://doi.org/10.1080/14765284.2021.2024485</a></li> <li>4) Jin, Y. (2022). The impact of FTAs on export duration: Evidence from China's agricultural firms. <i>The Journal of International Trade &amp; Economic Development</i>, 32(5), 793–823. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1080/09638199.2022.2138507">https://doi.org/10.1080/09638199.2022.2138507</a></li> </ol> </li> <li>7. Significant and quantified results should be incorporated into the abstract;</li> <li>8. The introduction needs to be completely rephrased. The context is not defined. There is no bibliographical comparison in this introduction. The problem underlying the study is not present. A coherent and relevant bibliographic study must be carried out to identify a problem. Clearly present the objective of this study and the methodological approach adopted. Minimum 2 pages for the introduction;</li> <li>9) <b>Materials and method.</b> Clearly present the assumptions and approximations of this study. Determinants such as: Arithmetic mean, weighted mean, marketing margin, marketing efficiency, marketing cost, price spread and producer's share in consumer's rupee, Acharya's approach, must be developed in the introduction</li> <li>9) Identify and clearly present the different market functionaries used as a statistical variable;</li> <li>10) Densify the argument on the methodology of the thematic approach; What is Acharya's approach? What is it for? How is it implemented?</li> <li>11) Replace the tables present in the results with histograms or any other statistical tools present in MS EXEL. Comment, highlight the discrepancies and errors characteristic of statistical work.</li> <li>12) Table 4 should be clearly divided into two distinct histograms. Same for Table 5.</li> <li>13) Conclusion: Present the purpose of the study, present and critique the methodological tools and the results. Identify opportunities for improvement.</li> </ol>	

**Review Form 1.7**

<b>Minor</b> REVISION comments		
1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?	English quality of the article suitable is for scholarly communications	
<b>Optional/General</b> comments	This study is interesting. It has scientifically validated results. The methodology is credible. The scientific Internet is present. However, the form and content deserve to be improved. The introduction should be taken up in its entirety. The material and method part should be corrected and densified. The results should be commented on and analyzed. The tables should be replaced by specialized histograms.	

**PART 2:**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

**Reviewer Details:**

Name:	<b>Merlin Zacharie Ayissi</b>
Department, University & Country	<b>National Polytechnic School of University of Douala, Cameroon</b>